Deans of Career and Technical Education: Charting the Course to Senior Administration

Shelley Zarovsky Levin
National-Louis University

Follow this and additional works at: https://digitalcommons.nl.edu/diss
Part of the Community College Leadership Commons

Recommended Citation
Levin, Shelley Zarovsky, "Deans of Career and Technical Education: Charting the Course to Senior Administration" (2010). Dissertations. 29.
https://digitalcommons.nl.edu/diss/29

This Dissertation - Public Access is brought to you for free and open access by Digital Commons@NLU. It has been accepted for inclusion in Dissertations by an authorized administrator of Digital Commons@NLU. For more information, please contact digitalcommons@nl.edu.
NATIONAL-LOUIS UNIVERSITY

DEANS OF CAREER AND TECHNICAL EDUCATION: CHARTING THE COURSE TO SENIOR ADMINISTRATION

A DISSERTATION SUBMITTED IN PARTIAL FULFILLMENT OF THE REQUIREMENTS FOR THE DEGREE DOCTOR OF EDUCATION

In
COMMUNITY COLLEGE LEADERSHIP

BY
SHELLEY ZAROVSKY LEVIN

Chicago, Illinois
June 2010
To my mother, Rona Zarovsky
ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS

Several people are thanked for their support and tutelage in the process of researching and writing this dissertation. First, special thanks are extended to Dr. Martin Parks, Chair of the Dissertation Committee, as well as to Dr. Dennis Haynes and Dr. Audrey (AJ) Styer, for their time and contributions as committee members. Dr. Parks, in particular, devoted countless hours of reflection and constructive input to guide me to achieve this worthy study. Further, thanks go to all of the instructors in the Community College Leadership Program whose thoughtful teaching contributed so much to what I learned throughout the program. In terms of other previous teachers, thanks are repeated time and again to the groundwork learned from Betsy Henle, who displayed a picture of a girdle on her desk, imploring her high school English students to support, support, support.

This achievement would not have been accomplished if not for members of the DOC 2 cohort and their support and cheerleading, particularly by Karen Persky, Dan Hagburg, Mark Mrozinski, Katie Storey, Jeff Boyd, and Angie Kaysen.

Were it not for the emphatic and ongoing belief in this endeavor by my family and friends, this road might have been insurmountable. For my “darling” mother, my inspired children, my supportive sisters, and my patient friends, thank you for believing in me. It is from the cocoon of your love and understanding that I emerge to embrace this dream.
ABSTRACT

The purpose of this study was to explore the essential leadership practices, abilities, and experiences of Deans of Career and Technical Education (CTE) and to consider how these Deans of CTE fit into the succession process of the community college. A qualitative case study was conducted with three dyads of career Deans and their supervising senior administrators, using the comparative case method to analyze the data collected from the participants.

The data were collected from in-person participant interviews on their respective campuses. One Dean of CTE and the supervising senior administrator were at a rural college; one dyad was at a suburban community college; and the third Dean of CTE and the supervising senior administrator were at an urban institution. All three colleges were situated in the Midwestern section of the United States and had large student populations.

From the data analysis, three general themes emerged as the essential practices, abilities, and experiences that were demonstrated by the Deans of CTE: (a) formal education and professional development; (b) personal background and experience; and (c) mentoring and networking. These three overarching themes spiraled into one categorical outcome: the crucial need for career Deans to be visible across campus and program areas, as well as to be acknowledged in professional groups that exist beyond the institution. The implications of the findings lead to the need for deliberate planning and preparation of Deans of CTE for succession strategies through mentoring relationships and supervising senior administrative support.
TABLE OF CONTENTS

LIST OF TABLES .......................................................................................................................... x

LIST OF FIGURES ...................................................................................................................... xi

Chapter

I. INTRODUCTION .................................................................................................................... 1

   Statement of Purpose ............................................................................................................. 2
   Guiding Questions .................................................................................................................. 2
   Background and Significance ............................................................................................... 3
      Relevance to the Field ......................................................................................................... 5
   Design .................................................................................................................................. 7
   Data Collection ..................................................................................................................... 12
   Data Analysis ....................................................................................................................... 13
   Limitations ............................................................................................................................ 14
   Delimitations ....................................................................................................................... 14
   Assumptions ......................................................................................................................... 15
   Organization of the Study ..................................................................................................... 15
   Chapter Summary ................................................................................................................. 16

II. LITERATURE REVIEW ........................................................................................................ 17

   Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 17
   Research Frameworks .......................................................................................................... 18
      Conceptual Framework #1: Essential Practices, Abilities, and Attributes ....................... 18
      Conceptual Framework #2: Mentoring and Networking .................................................. 23
      Theoretical Framework: Situational Leadership Theory .................................................. 30
   Work-Based Learning Model ............................................................................................... 33
   Chapter Summary ................................................................................................................. 36

III. METHODOLOGY ................................................................................................................ 38

   Introduction .......................................................................................................................... 38
   Guiding Questions ............................................................................................................... 38
   Research Design ................................................................................................................... 39
   Case Study ............................................................................................................................. 40
   Data Collection ..................................................................................................................... 42
Observations .......................................................... 44
Interviews .................................................................. 44
Documents ................................................................. 45
Audio-Visual Materials ................................................. 45
Research Procedures ..................................................... 46
Participant Selection ..................................................... 47
Trustworthiness and Credibility ........................................ 49
Data Analysis .............................................................. 49
  Essential Leadership Practices in CTE ..................... 50
  Essential Abilities in CTE ........................................ 51
  Essential Experiences in CTE ................................. 52
  Succession Planning Strategies .............................. 53
Transferability and Reflexivity ......................................... 54
Chapter Summary ......................................................... 55

IV. FINDINGS .................................................................. 57

Introduction .................................................................. 57
Purpose ......................................................................... 57
Guiding Questions .......................................................... 58
Research Protocol ........................................................... 59
Emergent and A Priori Themes ............................................ 61
Participants ................................................................. 62
Case Profiles ................................................................. 65
  Rural Community College (RCC) ............................. 67
  Suburban Community College (SCC) ....................... 68
  Urban Community College (UCC) ............................ 68
Case Findings by Theme .................................................... 69
Rural Community College (RCC) Case Findings by Themes .... 70
  Formal Education and Professional Development Factors:
    Emergent Theme #1 ................................................. 70
    Personal Attributes and Background Factors: Emergent
      Theme #2 .......................................................... 71
    Mentoring and Networking Factors: Emergent Theme #3 .... 73
  A Priori Themes Related to Rural Community College Findings .. 73
Suburban Community College (SCC) Case Findings by Themes .... 76
  Formal Education and Professional Development Factors:
    Emergent Theme #1 ................................................. 76
    Personal Attributes and Background Factors: Emergent
      Theme #2 .......................................................... 80
    Mentoring and Networking Factors: Emergent Theme #3 .... 81
  A Priori Themes Related to Suburban Community College
    Findings ............................................................. 81
Urban Community College (UCC) Case Findings by Themes .......... 87
Formal Education and Professional Development Factors:
Emergent Theme #1 ................................................................. 87
Personal Attributes and Background Factors: Emergent
Theme #2 .............................................................................. 92
Mentoring and Networking Factors: Emergent Theme #3 .......... 95
A Priori Themes Related to Urban Community
College Findings ..................................................................... 98
Findings Related to Guiding Questions ..................................... 98
Guiding Question 1: Leadership Practices ............................... 99
Guiding Question 2: Abilities ................................................. 99
Guiding Question 3: Experiences ........................................... 101
Guiding Question 4: Succession Planning ............................... 101
Guiding Question 5: Distinctions among Deans ..................... 103
Guiding Question 6: Facilitating Professional Development ...... 104
Chapter Summary .................................................................... 106

V. DISCUSSION, CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS AND
RECOMMENDATIONS ............................................................ 108

Introduction ............................................................................. 108
Discussion .................................................................................. 112
Essential Leadership Practices and Abilities Needed .................. 112
Essential Experiences Needed .................................................. 113
Essential Succession Planning Strategies Needed ..................... 113
Requirements of CTE Deans as Compared to Other Deans .......... 114
The Role Supervising Senior Administrators Play in Facilitating or
Inhibiting the Professional Development and Career Mobility of
CTE Deans ............................................................................. 114
Constant Comparative Analysis and Emergent Themes ............. 117
Conclusions .............................................................................. 120
Essential Leadership Strategies: Practices, Abilities, and
Experiences ............................................................................. 120
Comparisons of Deans of CTE with Other Deans ...................... 123
Career Trajectory and Succession Planning of CTE Deans ........ 124
Senior Administrators Promote or Inhibit Professional
Development and Career Mobility of CTE Deans ................. 124
Visibility ................................................................................... 125
Formal Education and Professional Development .................... 125
Mentoring and Networking ...................................................... 126
Personal Attributes and Background ....................................... 128
Succession Planning ................................................................. 129
The Visibility Paradox .............................................................. 131
Implications ............................................................................. 132
Implications for Deans of CTE ............................................... 132
APPENDICES ....................................................................................................................... 145

Appendix A: Interview Questions: Deans ................................................................. 145

Appendix B: Interview Questions: Supervising Senior Administrators ............ 147

Appendix C: Confidentiality Agreement with Transcriber ................................. 148

Appendix D: Informed Consent: Panel of Experts ................................................... 149

Appendix E: Demographic Questions: Dean Participants ................................. 151

Appendix F: Informed Consent: Participants ......................................................... 153
LIST OF TABLES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>TABLE</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1. Participant Location and Pseudonym</td>
<td>63</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2. Participant Demographic Data</td>
<td>64</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3. Comparative Institutional Documents</td>
<td>66</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>4. Comparative Expectations of Deans</td>
<td>123</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
## LIST OF FIGURES

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>FIGURE</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Page</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>A Model of Work-Based Learning at the Individual Level</td>
<td>34</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>A Model of Work-Based Learning as a Collective Property</td>
<td>36</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>Spiraling Themes Converge on Central Concept</td>
<td>119</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
CHAPTER 1

INTRODUCTION

Community college trends are turning to business and industry to meet the demands of a global economy and to reestablish their own viability in the face of reduced public funding. Increasingly, community colleges are partnering with business and industry (B & I) to meet community needs, to create programs that will attract and retain students, and to unlock private revenue channels (Friedman, 2007; Levin, 2001; Phillippe & Sullivan, 2005).

In light of these program and enrollment trends, there is heightened demand for leadership among career Deans. As new and expanded programs develop, there will be increased demand for capable and strong leadership among career Deans because these CTE programs are becoming increasingly important to the stability and longevity of the institution. Supervising senior administrators, therefore, will need to employ Deans on their administrative teams that can respond to community demands in ways that are consistent with the college's mission and current strategic plan.

Heretofore, little has been written about any systematic development for community college leaders, especially in the area of Career and Technology Education (CTE). As career Deans assume a wider and more prominent reach over fiscal and program responsibilities, it raises a question first about how they are best prepared for those duties, and second for how they are being prepared for their own career mobility.
Statement of Purpose

This research explores the experiences and processes that led select Deans of Career and Technical Education (CTE) to their current positions. It is assumed that there are similarities and differences in the career paths among different Deans of CTE. Further, it is essential to view those career paths in the context of the Deans’ of CTE career goals, the expectations of their supervising senior administrators, and the similarities and differences that exist between Deans of CTE and Deans of other areas of the community college.

Guiding Questions

To identify the exemplary leadership practices, competencies, experiences, and succession planning strategies required of Deans of CTE, the following guiding questions were addressed:

1. What are the essential leadership practices needed by deans of Career and Technical Education (CTE) in community colleges today?
2. What are the essential abilities needed by deans of CTE in community colleges today?
3. What are the essential experiences needed by deans of CTE in community colleges today?
4. What essential succession planning strategies are needed by deans of CTE in community colleges today?
5. How do the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for deans of CTE differ from those practices, abilities, and
planning strategies for other academic deans? How are the practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies the same?

6. How do supervising senior administrators facilitate or inhibit the professional development and career mobility of deans of CTE?

In this study, mentoring is defined as a form of the teaching and learning exchange between supervising senior administrators and the Deans they oversee. Further, mentoring is regarded as the basis upon which supervisors help their supervisees develop professionally.

**Background and Significance**

This study is significant to the field of community colleges in a number of ways. Community colleges are based on the premise of open access and affordability. According to Cohen and Brawer (2003), they were originally opened with the intention of offering the first two years of college general education courses as an extension of high school, thus allowing university faculty the time to teach higher level courses and continue their research. In other words, they were transfer agents for high school graduates who desired a four year degree. When the GI Bill was passed and veterans of World War II returned home, community colleges responded to job training and the employment realities of the post war economy. Community colleges provided affordable access to career education and training.

In today's economic and demographic climate, community colleges need a sustainable funding base. State funding is diminishing (AACC, 2005). Simultaneously, the colleges are partnering with business and industry to create and expand programs that
meet both the needs of the community and also the fiscal operations of the business of community college education.

The contemporary community college is challenged by the need to maintain the currency of curricula in light of workforce preparation mandates, competition from other education providers, and the globalized economy. [Today’s] colleges are developing programs that prepare workers for emerging career fields, such as information technology security and homeland security. (AACC, 2005, p. 5)

Further, baby boomers are finding that they either wish or need to remain employed at least part time, often in area of new interests or because their previous work became obsolete in the global market economy (U.S. Dept. of Labor, n.d., retrieved June 14, 2008). The American Association of Community Colleges (2005) reports that from 1993 through 2001, the age distribution of the majority of students attending community colleges ranged from 25 to 39, with part time enrollment for students fifty and older almost doubling between 1993 and 2001.

Given the increased demand for career education in the global economy, as well as for a burgeoning aging population of workers, community colleges need strong leadership to survive in the constantly changing frontier of business and industry. Therefore, this research is significant to the community college field because it explores how supervising senior administrators and career Deans respond to the global market and how supervising senior administrators mentor career Deans so that the Deans are effective members of the leadership team. Additionally, the expansion of the community college funding base with career education revenues helps to promote and secure the institution’s competitive edge and therefore its survival.
Scholarly research is lacking in any systemic framework for senior leadership development, particularly for the advancement of career Deans. Insights and information shared will be helpful to career Deans and supervising senior administrators.

Relevance to the Field

This study is relevant to the field of community colleges for three reasons. First, community colleges are based on the premise of open access and affordability. According to Cohen and Brawer (2003), they were originally opened with the intention of offering the first two years of college general education courses as an extension of high school, thus allowing university faculty the time to teach higher level courses and continue their research. In other words, they were transfer agents for high school graduates who desired a four year degree (Brint & Karabel, 2006; Cohen & Brawer, 2003). When the GI Bill was passed and veterans of World War II returned home, community colleges responded to job training and the employment realities of the post war economy. Community colleges provided affordable access to career education and training (Cohen & Brawer, 2003; Dougherty, 2006; Phillippe & Sullivan, 2005).

To provide that access in today's economic and demographic climate, community colleges need a sustainable funding base. Currently, state funding is diminishing (AACC, 2005). Simultaneously, the colleges are partnering with business and industry to create and expand programs that meet both the needs of the community and also the fiscal operations of the business of community college education. Hence, the second reason this research is relevant to the field.

The contemporary community college is challenged by the need to maintain the currency of curricula in light of workforce preparation mandates, competition
from other education providers, and the globalized economy. [Today's] colleges are developing programs that prepare workers for emerging career fields, such as information technology security and homeland security. (AACC, 2003, p. 5)

The third reason this study has value to the field of community colleges is because of a shift in how the aging population influences the labor market. Baby boomers are finding that they either wish or need to remain employed at least part time, often in areas of new interests or because their previous work became obsolete in the global market economy (U.S. Dept. of Labor, n.d., retrieved June 14, 2008). The American Association of Community Colleges (2005) reports that from 1993 through 2001, the age distribution of the majority of students attending community colleges ranged from 25 to 39, with part time enrollment for students fifty and older almost doubling between 1993 and 2001.

Given the increased demand for career education in the global economy, as well as for a rapidly increasing aging population of workers, and most recently, the American Recovery and Reinvestment Act (Pelosi, 2009), community colleges need strong leadership to survive in the burgeoning frontier of business and industry. Therefore, this research is significant because it explores how supervising senior administrators and career Deans respond to the training demands of a global market and how supervising senior administrators mentor career Deans so that the Deans are effective members of the leadership team. Additionally, the expansion of the community college funding base via career education revenues helps to promote or secure the institution's competitive edge and therefore its survival.

Discovering and implementing a plan for succession is another aspect of leadership that is critical to maintaining a competitive edge. Haynes and Ghosh (2008)
researched this issue by applying a systems evaluation approach to explore how organizations determine the role of mentoring, and the efficacy of the Strategic Collaboration Model (SCM) and its related succession management programs. The organization, by implementing a formal mentoring program, creates an infrastructure of succession planning. Organizational level mentoring increases organizational commitment; employee retention and motivation; leadership development; and improved organizational communication and productivity. Therein lays the pearl: reciprocal regard between management and employee fosters mutual benefit. The mentoring-centered succession management program develops leadership and facilitates the process of maintaining a competitive advantage in business practice.

Scholarly research is lacking in any systemic framework for senior leadership development, particularly for the advancement of career Deans. Therefore, insights from this research will be helpful to Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators.

**Design**

This research was conducted as a qualitative case study because the design is best suited for culling the information that is the focus of this research. In Creswell's (2007) book, *Qualitative Inquiry and Research Design*, he cites five characteristics of qualitative research, all of which are relevant to this study. The characteristics are: “(a) conducting the research in a natural setting; (b) using the researcher as a key instrument to the study; (c) studying multiple sources of data; (d) analyzing data inductively; (e) focusing on the participants' meaning; (f) establishing an emergent design; (g) applying a theoretical lens; (h) interpreting data subjectively; and (i) developing a holistic account” (pp. 37-39).
Primary research occurred in the natural setting of each community college campus where the career Deans and their supervising senior administrators worked. The researcher initiated a dialogue through which the Deans and supervising senior administrators as interviewees shared their stories with the researcher. Lincoln and Guba (1985) insist that the researcher is a human instrument because he is “responsive, adaptable, holistic in approach, has an ability to expand an existing knowledge base that adds depth and richness to understanding, lends processual immediacy, is able to clarify and summarize, and can explore atypical and idiosyncratic responses (p. 102).”

Quantitative research and statistical analyses do not tell the story about this issue. Rather, the study of career Deans’ essential leadership practices, abilities, and attributes is situated relative to institutional missions and cultures, individual supervising senior administrators’ styles, and ability of Deans to mesh their priorities with what is demanded of them by their senior administrators. Case study research permits a flexible framework that creates opportunities for an investigator to ask semi-structured, open-ended questions, reflect on a variety of responses, and make ongoing assessments based on inductive reasoning.

We conduct qualitative research because we need a complex, detailed understanding of the issue. This detail can only be established by talking directly with people, going to their places of work, and allowing them to tell the stories unencumbered by what we expect to find or what we have read in the literature. We conduct qualitative research when we want to empower individuals to share their stories, hear their voices, and minimize the power relationships that often exist between a researcher and the participants in a study. (Creswell, 2007, p. 40)

The selected supervising senior administrators and Deans of Career and Technical Education were interviewed in their own institutions, and they were encouraged to speak
openly and frankly about their individual and personal experiences. The study was therefore bounded or limited to the individuals interviewed and by the institutions in which they worked.

Relative to the qualitative paradigm, this research was conducted as a case study. According to Yin (2003), the case study relies on 'multiple sources of evidence, with data needing to converge in a triangulating fashion, and as another result benefits from the prior development of theoretical propositions to guide data collection and analysis' (p. 14). Through the series of in-depth interviews, institutional documents, field notes, and audio files, the thoughts and rationale provided by the participants provided rich data and insights that could ‘get at’ the point of the study. Leadership practices were viewed through the lens of situational theory. Essential leadership abilities and attributes of Deans of CTE presented a concept upon which practices were interpreted. Finally, any emergent mentoring relationships between the career Deans and supervising senior administrators were analyzed and interpreted. Narrative responses provided by the participants gave a holistic lens to the data analysis. Especially because this research focus was on the practices of community college supervising senior administrators and Deans of Career and Technical Education, it further advised use of a case study design.

Little is known about the professional development of career Deans in community colleges. Therefore, it was necessary to explore a variety of sources of information to reach what Stake (1995) termed emic issues: the understanding of experiences by the participants who were the ‘actors’ in the cases (p. 20). Van Manen (1990) referred to this commonality as a ‘universal essence’ by which one ‘grasps the very
nature of the thing’ (p. 177). The purpose of the research was to come to know that
essence to better understand the phenomenon of how career Deans come to provide
leadership in the context of a community college (Creswell, 2007).

Lincoln and Guba (1985) summarily list the important points that engender the
case study method:

(a) The case study is the primary vehicle for emic inquiry. (b) The case study
builds on the reader's tacit knowledge. (c) The case study is an effective vehicle
for demonstrating the interplay between inquirer and respondents. (d) The case
study provides the reader an opportunity to probe for internal consistency. (e) The
case study provides the thick description so necessary for judgments of
transferability. (f) The case study provides a grounded assessment of context. (pp.
359-360)

Another important quality of this research was the necessary involvement and
reflexivity of the researcher (Creswell, 2007; Moustakas, 1994). The researcher must
work to bracket biases and preconceived notions of the context, process, and outcomes of
the questions posed (Christensen & Johnson, 2004). Interview discussions led to other
questions to be asked. Thus, the research was bounded geographically, technologically,
and logistically so that it was possible to complete this portion of the project within the
given time constraints (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

Institutional records and field notes based on observations and reflection were
used as part of the data collection, in addition to the interviews and audio files, to better
understand the attributes and challenges of career Deans and to lend credibility to the data
and analysis (Hoepfl, 1997). This approach is called ‘methods triangulation’ (Christensen
The case study design utilized rich description. Thus, it was relevant to include the variances of context. For example, Deans of CTE and supervising senior administrators who worked in community colleges found in diverse geographical locations created a variation of context. Although it was common to all Deans of CTE that they demonstrated generally the same essential leadership attributes, there were differences in the social, political, and economic climate of the demographics; the individual institutional missions; the expectations of the supervising senior administrators; and the unique personal qualities that the Deans brought to the situation or case that might or might not be important to the research outcomes.

Through the interpretive paradigm, the practices, abilities, and attributes were studied and viewed with a lens of contextual and situational perspective (Willis, 2007). The researcher brought to the interviews and the study her own experiences and sets of expectations, or ‘world views’ (p. 96). She used herself as an instrument; she became part of the dynamic of the story, broke it down into letters and words, and then reconstructed the lines as a related but different tale. It is in the reflexive nature of the researcher’s analysis that the tale was given new meaning (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005). The researcher sought to know a participant’s inner reality, and then she asserted that reality to others. The retelling unfolded from ‘within a distinct interpretive community that configures, in its special way, the multicultural, gendered components of the research act’ (Denzin & Lincoln, 2005, p. 21). The participants’ stories became the researcher’s tale, constructed from the investigator’s mind’s eye of what she viewed in the author of origin. Therefore, the story morphed into the participants’ story, and more.
In the interpretive case study, the rich, thick data were collected and analyzed. Then they were studied in relation to theories or models (Willis, 2007). Essential practices, abilities, and attributes of Deans of CTE were the basic focus, and then the analysis of the data were considered as applied to the existing or a priori theory of situational leadership (Hersey, 1984), the model of work-based learning (Raelin, 1997), personal attributes and background, and the mentoring relationships between Deans and supervising senior administrators as a strategy for cultivating Dean leadership acumen.

Data Collection

The context of the three large community colleges, all situated in the Midwest, included one rural, one suburban, and one urban campus, together provided the geographic backdrop for this research. Participants were chosen from large colleges because the larger campuses tend to have more students and higher revenues in their career programs than do smaller ones.

Three Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators were interviewed in as many colleges. The supervising senior administrators had been in their positions for at least 3-5 years; the Deans had been in their positions for at least 3 years. In advance of the semi-structured interviews, the interview questions were forwarded, and curriculum vitae with the Deans' job descriptions, were requested from participants. Additionally, documents from their institutions, such as mission statements, strategic plans, and any professional development activities for middle and senior administrators were studied and analyzed. Field notes, both observational and reflective, were composed to further triangulate the research. Upon completion of the interview transcriptions, responses were
forwarded to participants for member checks (Lincoln & Guba, 1985). Concurrently, the data were reviewed, and the analysis began.

**Data Analysis**

The data analysis involved careful review of the material and documents. A process of organizing or coding the data occurred. As the data were coded, patterns or themes emerged and were interpreted. Data were reviewed repeatedly, coded again by themes, and eventually narrowed down to Stake's (1995) emic or the essence: a detailed picture of what Deans' of CTE leadership looked like, and how their practices, abilities, and attributes developed through personal background and a mentoring relationship with their supervising senior administrators. All data and documents were kept confidential and in a secure location in the researcher's home. An audit trail was thus maintained and available for use as needed (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).

A critical part of the data analysis was a review of the literature, in which previous research strengthened the current study's findings. The *a priori* themes applied to this study and the salient themes that emerged as the data were analyzed presented one of the "validation strategies" (Creswell, 2007, p. 207) for the research. The emergent themes of personal attributes and background, formal education and professional development, and mentoring and networking recurred as all of the data were collected and analyzed. The *a priori* themes that were drawn to validate the credibility of these emergent themes were the situational leadership theory (Hersey, 1984; Hersey, Blanchard, Johnson, & Dewey, 2008), the work-based learning model (Raelin, 1997; 2008), and the concept of mentoring.
Limitations

There were several observations and limitations to this study. First, it is possible that in the situational leadership theory model (Blanchard, Zigarmi, & Zigarmi, 1985), the leader is not fully aware of the subject matter in which the person being led needs direction, such as a supervising senior administrator who does not understand the needs of some of the technical career programs, so that s/he cannot give certain direction to the Dean. Another limitation was logistical; there were constraints on where the research could be conducted based on the participants’ locations and the program timeline. A third limitation was that only one of the three colleges in this research could provide written plans for professional development of administrators, so that it was therefore not possible to compare or draw conclusions about that strategy for succession planning.

Delimitations

This research intended to study the experiences through which Deans of CTE prepared for their role as successful leaders in the community college, and to identify the succession planning strategies that the Deans and their employing institutions might implement to nurture those Deans to senior leadership positions. Formal education and training, history of employment in career or technical fields, personal attributes and background, and self-described leadership practices were pursued in an effort to glean how Deans of CTE came to qualify or to be successful as leaders. Multiple sources were tapped to collect data about the career Deans and their roles, including institutional strategic plans, human resource job descriptions, and any professional development opportunities afforded to the Deans of CTE. Specifically, influences by the Deans’ current
supervising senior administrators were sought to better understand the expectations they had of the Deans for their positions with CTE programs and as part of the wider leadership stratum in the colleges. Similarly, it was relevant to seek the lens through which the career Deans perceived their supervising senior administrators’ expectations of the career Deans. Finally, gender comparisons were made by participants when describing their own leadership in specific situations, but references were inconsistent and therefore considered only if related to the purpose of the study and in response to the guiding questions. Gender differences in career Deans’ leadership and career mobility might be studied in subsequent research.

Assumptions

The following assumptions were held regarding this study: (a) participants gave honest answers to the interview questions; (b) participants were commonly known to be competent for the positions that they represented in their respective institutions; (c) participants were expected to and, in fact, performed their leadership responsibilities to the best of their abilities; and (d) continuing need existed to develop succession strategies among the Dean level administrators for senior leadership positions in the community college.

Organization of the Study

Chapter 1 has provided a background for the purpose of this research. An historical perspective, giving way to current trends, leads to the rationale for this research. An overview of how participants were chosen and the method of study were provided. In Chapter 2, a review of the literature outlines a priori concepts and a theory
that ground the findings of this study. Chapter 3 describes the methodology of the research, along with the data analysis and data management. The following chapter, Chapter 4, reveals the findings from all of the data sources, with particular emphasis on extensive interviews with the six participants. Finally, Chapter 5 discusses the findings in terms of conclusions that can be drawn from the study, implications for the practices and field of community colleges, and recommendations for further research.

**Chapter Summary**

This chapter provided the historical and economic background of the community college that has led to the current need for administrative leadership in Career and Technical Education. It presented six key questions that guided the research, after which the design, method of data collection, and data analysis of the study were outlined. The chapter described the limitations and delimitations of this research, and then the organization of the subsequent chapters was provided.
CHAPTER 2
LITERATURE REVIEW

Introduction

Many relationships and experiences contribute to how adults pursue their careers. Birth family, education, and work experiences can each have a profound effect on which abilities people develop and opportunities people grasp on their way to achieving their career goals. Some of the strength that is fostered by family responsibilities, community involvement, and innate passions propel individuals to work their way into positions of leadership.

This chapter provides a review of literature that addresses the \textit{a priori} concepts and theoretical framework that supports and helps organize the findings of this study. In situational leadership (Hersey, 1984), the leadership strategies are seen through the lens of supervisors who assess the leadership abilities of their supervisees in the context of specific situations. In this model, it is the supervisors who adjust their behaviors and expectations to accommodate the competence and willingness of the supervisee.

Related to the situational leadership theory is the concept that approaches the dynamics between the supervisor and the supervisee through the lens of those who are supervised, and the supervisee's perceived role in relation to the larger context of community, or the organization. In this case, the responsibility to take initiative or to adjust to a given situation rests on the supervisee. This concept is referred to as work-based learning (Raelin, 1987).
Research Frameworks

In an initial review of the literature, two concepts and one theory emerge to construct the central framework for this study. The first concept is identified as essential leadership practices, abilities, and attributes as applied to Deans of CTE in the community college. The second concept that lends direction to leadership development is the process of mentoring by the supervising senior administrator of the career Dean. Completing the conceptual framework is Hersey and Blanchard's situational leadership theory (Hersey et al., 2008), which proffers a working model through which a relationship between the supervisor-supervisee is flexible enough to be responsive to the requirements of the task-at-hand and the development goals of and for the supervisee. Finally, related to situational leadership theory is the work-based learning model developed by Robert Raelin (1997), in which he articulates a concept of work context learning, as specifically applied to academia, and in which leadership development occurs. Summarily, this review of literature explores the practices, abilities, and attributes of administrators in higher education, the mentoring as a key part of administrators’ professional development, the theory of situational leadership (Hersey, 1984; Hersey et al., 2008), and the model of work-based learning (Raelin, 1997; 2006; 2007; 2008).

Conceptual Framework #1: Essential Practices, Abilities, and Attributes

Dr. Sharon McDade, Director of the Council on Education Fellow Program, has made noteworthy contributions to the study of leadership development in higher education. As recently as 1987, McDade recognized the absence of a nomenclature for professional development programs that promoted leadership skills. In Higher Education
Leadership: Enhancing Skills through Professional Development Programs, McDade (1987) outlined the major responsibilities of academic administrators in two broad categories. The first category was responsibility of vision, goals and action, which included development of innovation; development of consensus; development of decisions; development of resources; responsibility for operations; responsibility for relationships with the environment. The second responsibility was for people: to develop people; develop the work environment; develop communication; and develop necessary skills and knowledge (McDade, 1987). Expounding further, McDade described skill sets for administrators previously identified: peer skills; leadership skills; conflict-resolution skills; and information processing skills. Another point made by McDade is that there needs to be a plan for leadership development that is supported by colleagues and supervisors and that is integrated into the overall institutional plan. Examples of such plans are discussed later in this chapter.

Leadership competencies. On April 9, 2005, the Board of Directors of the American Association of Community Colleges (AACC) unanimously approved a document that provided a guideline for leadership. In it, there were six specific competencies identified, including: organizational strategy, resource management, communication, collaboration, community college advocacy, and professionalism. In the survey upon which the document is based, 100% of the participants noted that each of the six competencies was either ‘very’ or ‘extremely’ essential to the effective performance of a community college leader (AACC, 2005, p. 1). However, the document also revealed that while the six competencies are vital to community college leadership, respondents
disclosed that their own personal, formal training was seriously lacking in relation to the competencies. Further, the respondents who were employed by leadership development programs replied that their training in the six competencies was only ‘minimal’ or ‘moderate’ (AACC, 2005, p. 2). ‘These findings suggest a crucial need to establish this framework to promote these competencies in the curricula of community college leadership programs’ (AACC, 2005, p. 2).

The competencies of leadership are based on the application of some key principles, one of which is that:

The leadership gap can be addressed through a variety of strategies such as college grow-your-own programs, AACC council and university programs, state system programs, residential institutes, coaching, mentoring, and on-line and blended approaches. Important considerations that apply to all forms of delivery include sustaining current leaders and developing new ones. (AACC, 2005, p. 2)

William Mapp (2007), at Walden University, did exploratory research on leadership competencies of Arizona public community college middle and senior administrators using surveys and multidimensional scaling. Two of his questions were:

(a) ‘What leadership competencies are needed for community college administrators?’ and (b) ‘What are appropriate ways to develop those competencies’ (p. 3). In short, his findings indicated that competencies of community college administrators rated most highly were interpersonal skills of leadership, communication, strategic planning, conflict resolution, budget management, and personnel. Mapp also found that from the 69% or 140 respondents out of 201 administrators invited to participate, the ratings for the best way to develop those leadership skills were considered to be: ‘(a) attending seminars; (b) identifying a mentor; (c) engaging in hands-on-experience; (d) participating in a
community college leadership program; (e) enrolling in a classroom; and (f) other opportunities (Mapp, 2007, p. 3). The identified competencies and the opportunities for development of them are relevant to this study because both topics directly relate to the concepts articulated in the situational leadership theory (Hersey et al., 2008) and in Raelin's (1997) work-based learning model.

Winnie LaNier, as a doctoral student at the University of La Verne, approached community college competencies from a different perspective. In her dissertation research, LaNier (2006) looked at culturally competent behaviors of senior college administrators from as many as 30 institutions and compared data from surveys about developing culturally proficient learning communities. A second part of her study used interviews to look at how supervising senior administrators perceived the culturally competent practices of their colleges. Using a mixed method design for her research, she determined that

cultural proficiency is crucial to effective leadership. Supervising senior administrators and their colleges apply some elements of cultural proficiency. However, the culturally competent behaviors and practices of supervising senior administrators and their colleges are insufficient in developing culturally proficient learning environments. (p. 5)

LaNier's (2006) alarming findings indicated that it was with substantially low regularity that the supervising senior administrators demonstrated the behaviors that assess culture, value diversity, manage dynamics of difference, and institutionalize cultural knowledge. The supervising senior administrators perceived that their colleges often practiced behaviors to assess culture, value diversity, manage dynamics of difference, and “sometimes” institutionalize cultural knowledge. (p. 5)
LaNier’s study raises the question of how Deans of CTE will develop cultural competence if their supervising senior administrators and the institutions in general function poorly in that area.

Her recommendations also included offering a formal, systemic process to educate the campus community about cultures, including expecting faculty to integrate appropriate cultural issues into curriculum and performance evaluation systems. She recommended that the community college district leaders “support research and educational development so that the college more successfully fulfills its societal role” (LaNier, 2006, p. 5).

How administrators demonstrate the value of diversity is a gray area. It has been found that among administrators of color and ethnicity, at least in one study, it did not provide adequate numbers from which conclusions about their leadership development and job trajectory could be drawn; it is still a Caucasian-dominated, albeit both male and female, environment (Amey, VanDerLinden, & Brown, 2006). Consequently, the findings of this particular study provide insight to the challenges of developing senior leadership that demonstrate cultural and ethnic competence. Form, the hierarchical leadership structure, does not therefore appear to support meaning, or culturally competent practices. “There is much work to be done in generating diverse candidate pools for senior positions, in preparing younger generations of administrators with the skills and experiences that assist in promotion, and in promoting equality for the most senior positions” (Amey et al., 2006, p. 171).
The potential for diversity in community college leadership exists, but it might have to be at first contrived to achieve the goal of cultural and ethnic competence. By recruiting and promoting such diversity, the administration creates an opportunity to construct a hierarchical leadership structure that meets those criteria. In other words, the situation of opportunity needs to be created and sustained.

**Conceptual Framework #2: Mentoring and Networking**

There are several benefits to mentoring as an organizational structure in community college leadership development, one of the most important of which is the self-reflecting quality of the process. Mentoring has a primarily organic structure (Jones, 2007). It provides for flexibility and an ability to make changes easily. It is a process between two people, a relationship and unique situations in which issues are constantly being reshaped and changed, as is typical in community college culture. Especially in informal mentoring, there tends to be a flow or rhythm to how much direction is given, depending on the people, situation, and timing involved. Organic structures lend themselves to adaptive cultures, which are “cultures that value innovation and encourage and reward experimentation and risk taking by middle and lower-level managers” (Jones, 2007, p. 343).

Victor Vroom and Arthur Jago (2007) studied the process of leadership development through the relationships between leaders and subordinates, and then took the research further to examine the impact of situation on leadership behaviors and, in turn, how leaders make decisions. The authors depict a convincing context to their study, relating previous research findings concerning leadership as a process; it indicates
personal behaviors; it relates to situations and what kind of impact those situations have on behaviors; and it examines the relationships between leaders and subordinates. Vroom and Jago found that leadership involves three distinct roles of situational variables: organizational effectiveness is affected by situational factors not under leaders' control; situations shape how leaders behave; and situations influence the consequences of leader behavior. Broadening their lens to include the role that context plays on influencing behavior, Vroom and Jago (2007) examined the interaction among leadership style, situation, and effectiveness outcomes, and concluded that leadership can only be understood in relation to context or situations. Situation accounts for about three times as much variance as do individual differences, which underscores the important role that situational forces play in guiding action. Their work supports the situational leadership theory of Hersey and Blanchard (2008) and lends credibility to Raelin's (1997) work-based learning model.

Organizational culture is yet a different lens by which to view the situational or environmental issues around leadership development. Jones (2007) defines culture as ‘the set of shared values and norms that controls organizational members' interactions with each other and with suppliers, customers, and other people outside the organization’ (p. 8). Organizational change, he continues, is ‘the process by which organizations redesign their structures and cultures to move from their present state to some desired future state to increase their effectiveness’ (p. 9). The mentoring structure frames a situation and culture of professional development through which senior leadership fosters the growth and skills of junior administrators, thereby cultivating effective future senior leadership and
facilitating a plan for succession that sustains the values and culture of the community college. “It is the organizational structure and culture that are the principal means or fulcrum managers use to change the organization so it can achieve its future desired state” (Jones, 2007, p. 9). Mentors or senior leadership create and use the organizational framework and culture to guide behaviors, attitudes, and values forward to promote the mentee and advance the institution.

Related to this lens is another study by Sharon McDade (2005), in which she wrote of the changing relationships of mentors and protégés. McDade studied the learning process that occurs in the relationships between community college presidents and potential presidents. Interestingly, she explained leadership development as on-the-job and facilitated, the latter of which referred to the mentoring relationship. The on-the-job perspective blends with Raelin’s model of work-based learning. McDade examined strategies used by mentors to advance the leadership cognitive complexity of protégés. Also linked to her work is the relevance of situation to the process, demonstrating application of Hersey and Blanchard’s situational leadership theory (Hersey, 1984; Hersey et al., 2008) and lending credibility to the Vroom and Jago (2007) study. McDade (2005) found that the strategies employed by mentors included listening, reflecting, and mirroring critical thinking ideas and actions, motivating people to think critically, regularly evaluating progress, and helping critical thinkers create networks. The mentor listened, challenged, and listened to the protégés process the challenge, out of which came increased cognitive complexity about the situation and an ability to apply lessons to other circumstances. It was upon the mentee’s application of previously learned
experience that the protégé and the mentee could evaluate the success of the mentoring organizational structure. Self-reflection led to the cultivation of complex behavioral repertoires, expressed in the language of leadership cognitive complexity and demonstrated in novel challenging situations. This cognitive complexity might be considered the essence of the core competencies required for successful leadership as outlined in the AACC (2005) monograph.

While mentoring as an aspect of leadership development is mentioned often in the literature, little research has been conducted on the use of mentoring as a framework for fostering senior leadership among Deans in individual community colleges or in systems thereof. There are leadership chair academies, conferences, and other episodic opportunities to guide faculty and Deans in their professional development, but little research has been done to study how ongoing institutional mentoring, as a system, might be useful in formalizing a succession plan and encouraging Deans into senior administration. Furthermore, there is debate about the kind of mentoring that provides leadership support and advancement: formal, informal, or a combination of both.

J. B. Rowley (1999) wrote about leadership and mentoring of faculty, but his thoughts are also applicable to administrators in the community college. In this document, Rowley distinguished traits of the effective mentor as being committed to the role of mentoring; accepting of the beginning [administrator]; providing skilled support; being effective in different interpersonal contexts; modeling continuous learning; and communicating hope and optimism. Being effective interpersonally and the hope and optimism, in particular, relate to the AACC’s (2005) core competency of communication.
Rowley identified the Mentoring Leadership and Resource Network, an offshoot of the Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development (ASCD), and described the network as a model to support educators everywhere with best practices in mentoring and induction. Rowley outlined four main purposes to provide an organizational vehicle for a mentoring initiative: increase the knowledge base and general awareness of best practices in mentoring and induction; promote and provide effective training for new mentors; establish mentoring of new administrators as the norm in community colleges; and establish, through mentoring, the norms of collegiality, collaboration, and continuous professional development. Thus, Rowley articulated some of the nuts and bolts of how a mentoring framework might function relative to the mentoring dyad.

Not unique to higher education, there are reasons that mentoring is not built into the structure of large organizations. Satter and Russ (2007) asked the questions, “Why Don’t More Senior Leaders Mentor? And How They are Mortgaging Their Company’s Future in the Process” in their research published in the *Journal of Management Inquiry*. The article reports on a two year study of mentoring as an overlooked and important factor in developing leadership in business, especially for the soft skills deemed necessary to successfully navigate the business culture. In this research, the authors describe the five most commonly identified barriers senior executives perceive to mentoring middle or lower level management. Barriers include believing: mentoring is not a strategic objective in the company; there is not enough time; mentoring is too emotionally-charged; executives do not know how to mentor; and mentoring is not effective. Providing evidence that mentoring is important to the healthy longevity of a
business, Satter and Russ outlined four strategies to promote a mentoring culture in any organization: make it a strategic objective; include mentoring in regular talent mapping sessions; include formal and informal discussions about mentoring staff during meetings; and provide training to executives on how to mentor.

In *Leadership in Higher Ed*, McDade (1998) discussed issues of professional development among administrators in higher education, through which she insisted that although evidence was based on anecdotal, tentative and personal information, professional development experiences of administrators in higher education “increased promotability” (p. 3). In that research, she found that most administrators came to their positions from academic teaching, and therefore had no training in administration. Her contention was that, for every strength demonstrated by an individual administrator, a weakness could also be identified. On-the-job experiences that evolved from unplanned career paths were not enough to prepare the in-house candidates for administrative positions. McDade (1988) stated, “To be most effective, professional development experiences need to be part of an integrated, comprehensive organizational plan that links development activities with the actual tasks and responsibilities of the job” (p. 3). Her discussion speaks to the necessity of both professional development and succession planning. She once again points to agreement with Raelin’s idea of contextual or community-based learning.

Among the few established mentoring systems that have been researched are the ones in the College of Liberal Science and Arts (lsa) at the University of Michigan (2002) and the statewide network in California, the Association of California Community
College Administrators (ACCCA) Mentor Program. While the University of Michigan articulates a position statement and some guidelines for best practice in mentoring at all levels of faculty, staff, and administration, it is the ACCCA Mentor Program that offers history of a practiced framework and a credible assessment of its success. Edward Valeau and George Boggs (2004), in *An Assessment of the Association of California Community College Administrators (ACCCA) Mentor Program*, present findings about mentoring in the California system. While some research focuses on the dynamics between mentors and mentees, the Valeau and Boggs study focuses singularly on the mentor. The organizational network represented by the ACCCA mentoring program was developed in 1988. However, the characteristics of mentors such as skills, values, and ideology had not been assessed prior to the Valeau and Boggs (2004) research. Education, training, and development of mentors within this statewide system were thus explored. Data were collected in three parts: demographics, structured questionnaire, and unstructured survey.

One of the major findings of Valeau and Boggs' research (2004) was that there is wide inconsistency in how administrators as mentors are trained for their role. Another outcome of the study was that the data provided a pragmatic context to the AACC's (2005) core competencies. Unlike the University of Michigan's (2002) position statement, another finding in the Valeau and Boggs research was that mentors identified a weakness to the program's success as the omission of a guideline for activities that would help meet program expectations. Their bounded research provided an opportunity to systematically evaluate the program.
The formal or mechanistic aspect of mentoring is the structure by which a community college plans how mentoring occurs, with whom, for how long, and general parameters about what outcomes might be expected (Jones, 2007). Still, each mentoring relationship differs from another. In her article, *When is a Mentor Like a Monk?* Cristina Gonzalez (2006) introduces the genesis of formal mentoring from medieval Catholic and Greek Orthodox churches. Tracing how monks used the organizational structure of formal mentoring to acculturate new members and sustain succession among diverse cultures and ethnicities, Gonzalez claims that contemporary institutions of higher education have had to implement professionally-obligated formal structures to respond to the diversifying demographics not previously part of the Protestant landscape of higher education. Gonzalez expounds about the University of California, Davis, where there is a list of guidelines for mentoring, including that mentoring occurs at all levels; departments articulate and implement mentoring strategies; colleges, schools, and divisions take responsibility for departmental strategies; and central administration expands mentoring resources and establishes a members-at-large program.

**Theoretical Framework #1: Situational Leadership Theory**

Once senior leadership embraces diversity, administrators can implement the situational leadership model, developed by Hersey and Blanchard (Blanchard et al., 1985; Hersey, 1984; Hersey et al., 2008). This conceptual model presents a useful framework for community college senior leadership development that is based on Blanchard's theory of support and teaching. The model compares the leadership styles in a two-by-two matrix structure for the leadership continuum, based on four prescribed situations: (a)
‘directing or telling leaders; (b) coaching or selling leaders; (c) supporting or participating leaders; and (d) delegating leaders’ (p. 30). It is logical in its structure and flexible in its function. The theory contends that the degree to which a leader needs to impose oneself depends on the degree of maturity and ability of the subordinate. The matrix presents the four situational scenarios, ranging from what they explain as explicit direction and subordinate follower, to delegating leadership and more of a model of shared responsibility.

Where on the continuum of the model any leadership style falls depends on the leader's assessment of the subordinate’s developmental level. In cases where the worker has low competence but high commitment, the situation calls for one of four types of leadership, depending on the developmental level of the supervisee: They are Level 1: low competence with high commitment; Level 2: some competence with low commitment; Level 3: high competence with variable commitment; and Level 4: high competence with high commitment (Blanchard et al., 1985). Workers who demonstrate low competence and high commitment, a more assertive and participatory leader is required. Similarly, for workers who demonstrate high competence and high commitment, the leadership required can be less directly involved.

Later, the situational leadership model evolved to include another matrix that provides a bridge for assessing how to blend the appropriate fit between the degree of directed leadership and the development level of the subordinate (Hersey et al., 2008). In this matrix, the descriptors provide that bridge. The degree of direction ranges from Level 1: unable or insecure and unwilling; Level 2: unable but confident or willing; Level 3
able but insecure or unwilling; and Level 4: able and confident and willing. From this matrix, it is explained that where there is a continuum of leadership direction, there is also a continuum of ability, confidence, and willingness. In another example, the worker with emergent skills, such as a career Dean with limited financial management competence, may be able to develop a career program budget, but be insecure about making certain projections. In this case in point, the person being led has moderate competence and perhaps high commitment, so the appropriate leadership direction falls between ‘unable but confident and willing’ and ‘able but insecure or unwilling,’ where the leader is supportive and helpful but is not necessarily extremely directing. Particularly noteworthy about this model is that the leader is the person who needs to adapt and make accommodations for the developmental level of the person being led (Hersey et al., 2008).

Likewise, the focus of research on the mentoring program implemented throughout the California Community College system by Valeau and Boggs (2004) emphasized the role of the mentor. At the time they conducted their research survey, over 225 middle level administrators had previously or were currently participating in one of the only system-wide mentoring program for community college administrators. In this program that extended across California, the middle level administrators as protégés were paired with participating senior administrators for a minimum of a one-year commitment in an effort to learn some of the essential leadership strategies required for career advancement.
In another study using the situational theory model as a lens, Nastri (1985) found from a mixed design study that, using a combination of survey outcomes and interviews, some Massachusetts community college student services administrators preferred a style of leadership that utilized high support (identified as empathy) and low directive behavior toward peers and constituents. Further, she found through application of this model that administrators demonstrated a willingness to be flexible and vary their leadership style to match what they considered effective for any given situation. Career Deans are required to lead diverse groups who have a variety of both professional and personal needs and priorities. In this case, such a Dean might choose to employ the situational approach, based on the assumption that constituents are competent, are interested in contributing to decisions, and are self-directing.

**Work-Based Learning Model**

Related to Blanchard's (2008) premise of leadership based on support and teaching, Joseph Raelin (1997), at the Wallace E. Carroll School of Management at Boston College, developed a work-based learning model. Where the situational leadership model emphasizes how leaders assess and assert direction, Raelin's focus is first on the learner, or the person being led, and second, on the work community in which the learner is doing the job.

In his research published in *Organization Science*, Raelin (1997) brings together the dimensions of (a) how people learn, (b) forms of knowledge or information, and (c) levels of activity. From a perspective of learning through experience, reflection, and the cultivation of community of practice, Raelin contends that learning on-the-job requires a
systemic and fluid framework. He articulates a view on ‘theory and practice modes of learning and explicit and tacit forms of knowledge’ (Raelin, 1997, p. 564). Here, explicit knowledge refers to the skills or mechanics of what a person knows and can clearly articulate. ‘Explicit knowledge is the codified form that is transmittable in formal, systematic language’ (p. 564). Implicit knowledge, on the other hand, is the learning that occurs by active engagement. The implicit knowledge might be explained as guiding how a person perceives a situation and thus processes what decision is made in relation to that situation. Thus, his ideas are predicated on the notion of contextual experience.

Raelin (1997; 2008) further explains his model in terms of individual and community properties. Defining the work-based learning model as an individual property, he organizes learning into theory and practice. Knowledge is organized as explicit and tacit. In Figure 1, he shows what occurs at the intersections of the four components.

*Figure 1.* A model of work-based learning at the individual level.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEARNING</th>
<th>KNOWLEDGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Explicit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory</td>
<td>Conceptualization</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice</td>
<td>Reflection</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The first inference, where theory and explicit knowledge intersect, is conceptualization, which Raelin (1997) says is necessary in the work-based learning
model if [workers] are to adopt the capacity to deal with change and with future; indeed, if they are to imagine’ (p. 565). He says it lends language to a theory so that practitioners can analyze; it can also ‘provide a basis for subsequent reflection on and reappraisal of action’ (p. 566).

The second theoretical intersection is with tacit knowledge, wherein the learner experiments with application of theory to ‘know’ the idea (Raelin, 1997, p. 566). In practice, the intersection with explicit knowledge is reflection, through which the learner considers what is theorized and how the theory fits with the situation. Finally, the fourth inference is: learning practice and tacit knowledge intersect as experience. The dynamic between practice and the deeply rooted knowing propels the learner into a higher level of understanding.

The other categorical area that Raelin (1997) identifies is work-based learning as a collective property, revealed in Figure 2. In this model, he expounds on how the individual work-based learner fits into the community of other work-based learners. He explains that this notion is based on explicit knowledge of the theory of applied science, tacit knowledge action learning theory, tacit practice of community of practice, and explicit practice of action science. Applying his framework to the larger context of the whole work community, Raelin goes on to explain how his model ‘can be used in practice as a program for learner development’ (p. 572).

Further discussion of Raelin’s (1997, 2008) work as it relates to career Dean development and mentoring in the community college will be addressed in chapter five. It is reasonable to use this model when assessing how Deans learn about their
responsibilities such as financial management, specific career and technology programs, and institutional policies and practices. While one can argue that casual and informal

Figure 2. A model of work-based learning as a collective property.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>LEARNING</th>
<th>KNOWLEDGE</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Explicit</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Theory</td>
<td>Applied Science</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Practice</td>
<td>Action Science</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

work-based learning occurs constantly, Raelin’s model is logical and thoughtful. It presents an institutional plan that includes a formal structure in which everyone has a distinct role and reaps an identifiable benefit. It dovetails with Hersey and Blanchard's (1986; 2008) situational leadership theory because both take into consideration the context, are based on the evaluative relationship between learner and leader or mentor, and include a continuum of abilities through which the learner or follower progresses via a process that is embedded in reflection.

Chapter Summary

As noted in the literature, there are isolated, formally-structured instances in which Deans of CTE can pursue professional development (Gonzalez, 2006; McDade & Lewis, 1994; Valeau & Boggs, 2004). There are occasional community colleges that have an established system for such leadership development, as well as multi-campus systems, consortia, networks and other associations. However, there is not a universally-
recognized nomenclature for institutions to develop leadership and an effective succession plan.

This chapter presented *a priori* concepts and theories that provide a context to the research findings. They included first the conceptual framework of essential practices, abilities, and attributes of leadership; and the second conceptual framework of mentoring and networking. The theoretical frameworks that were provided as context for the research and spoke to the relationship between supervisor and supervisee were the situational leadership theory (Hersey, 1984) and in academe, the work-based learning model (Raelin, 1997).
CHAPTER 3

METHODOLOGY

Introduction

The purpose of this study was to identify the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies used by exemplary community college Deans of CTE. This chapter, therefore, discusses the guiding questions that were explored to better understand the competencies necessary to be successful; experiences that led the Deans of CTE to their positions; and succession planning strategies they might have implemented. To answer the guiding questions, the chapter further explains how and why the research was designed as a qualitative case study; how data were collected and analyzed; what procedures were followed to conduct the study; and how participants were selected.

Guiding Questions

This research explores the experiences and processes that led the Deans of CTE to their current positions. It is assumed that there are similarities and differences in the career paths among different Deans of CTE. Further, it is essential to view those career paths in the context of the Deans' of CTE career goals, the expectations of their supervising senior administrators, and the similarities and differences that exist between Deans of CTE and Deans of other areas of the community college. To identify the exemplary leadership practices, competencies, experiences, and succession planning strategies required of Deans of CTE, the following guiding questions were addressed:
1. What are the essential leadership strategies practiced by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

2. What are the essential abilities needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

3. What are the essential experiences needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

4. What are the essential succession planning strategies needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

5. How do the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE differ from those practices, abilities, and planning strategies for other academic deans? How are the practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies the same?

6. How do supervising senior administrators facilitate or inhibit the professional development and career mobility of Deans of CTE?

Research Design

The highly complex nature of the role and responsibilities of Deans of CTE in the modern community college required a holistic design that incorporated the multiple dimensions of qualitative inquiry. Qualitative case study research was selected as the design for this study because it:

- optimizes understanding by pursuing scholarly research questions. It gains credibility by thoroughly triangulating the descriptions and interpretations, not just in a single step but continuously throughout the period of study. Case study concentrates on experiential knowledge of the case and close attention to the influence of social, political, and other contexts. (Stake, 2005, pp. 443-445)
In this study, each participating Dean of CTE was considered a ‘case’ or unit of analysis. Stake (1995; 2006) defined the case as a unit that has boundaries making it different or unique in some way from other cases. The research was an inquiry of a bounded system, or case, in which multiple sources of information were used to collect details that, when interpreted, portrayed an in-depth picture of the cases (Creswell, 2007). The path one CTE Dean followed to reach his position provided a history and a process. However, to gain a full perspective of the case, it was necessary to explore and compare multiple cases. Multiple histories and processes, by comparative analysis, lent clarity both to individual, unique cases and to the commonalities shared among all of them.

Use of three cases allowed the ‘grouping together of answers from different people to common questions or analyzing different perspectives on central issues’ (Patton, 1990, p. 376). Therefore, in this study, three Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators constituted the multiple case studies that were examined.

**Case Study**

Case study research permits a flexible framework that creates opportunities for an investigator to ask semi-structured, open-ended questions, reflect on a variety of responses, and make ongoing assessments based on inductive reasoning.

We conduct qualitative research because we need a *complex*, detailed understanding of the issue. This detail can only be established by talking directly with people, going to their places of work, and allowing them to tell the stories unencumbered by what we expect to find or what we have read in the literature. We conduct qualitative research when we want to empower individuals to share their stories, hear their voices, and minimize the power relationships that often exist between a researcher and the participants in a study. (Creswell, 2007, p. 40)
The selected Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators were interviewed in their own institutions, and were encouraged to speak openly and frankly about their individual and personal experiences relative to the exemplary leadership practices, competencies, experiences, and succession planning strategies required of Deans of CTE. The results of the study were limited to the individuals interviewed and by the institutions in which they were employed.

According to Yin (2003), the case study relies on multiple sources of evidence, with data needing to converge in a triangulating fashion, and as another result benefits from the prior development of theoretical propositions to guide data collection and analysis’ (p. 14). Through the series of in-depth interviews, institutional documents, field notes, and audio files, the rich data and insights identified the exemplary leadership practices, competencies, experiences, and succession planning strategies required of Deans of CTE. Lincoln and Guba (1985) summarize the components of a case study as the primary vehicle for this emic inquiry (the categorization of characteristics unique to a specific group):

1. The case study builds on the reader's tacit knowledge.
2. The case study is an effective vehicle for demonstrating the interplay between inquirer and respondents.
3. The case study provides the reader an opportunity to probe for internal consistency.
4. The case study provides the thick description so necessary for judgments of transferability.
5. The case study provides a grounded assessment of context (pp. 359-360). The case study design utilizes rich description. Thus, it is relevant to include the variances of context. For example, Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators who work in community colleges that are found in diverse geographical locations created a variation of context.

Although it was common to all Deans of CTE that they had the same general leadership attributes, there were differences in the social, political, and economic climate throughout the region; the individual institutional missions; the expectations of the supervising senior administrators; and the unique personal qualities that the Dean of CTE brought to the situation or case that may or may not have been important to the research outcomes. This research used the stories of participants to find common and uncommon experiences to understand through their individual lens what essential practices, abilities, and attributes the Deans of CTE needed to be successful community college leaders. By exploring what kind of mentoring occurred, threads of leadership development strategies emerged and were examined in relation to the theory of situational leadership and the model of work-based learning.

Data Collection

Following Stake's (1995) guidelines, the data gathering was organized according to (a) who was interviewed, where, and when; and (b) which documents were collected and used as part of the study. The documents collected included the institution's mission and strategic plan to explore if the college explicitly included succession planning in its long term agenda; the professional development system for administrators if it existed, to
explore how and to what extent the institution had implemented procedures for career mobility and succession planning; and the job descriptions for the Dean of CTE and the academic Deans so that the institutional expectations for their positions could be compared, as well as to explore how well the Deans of CTE met those expectations. Three Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators were interviewed in person on their respective campuses between July 1 and September 1, 2009. It was anticipated that for each CTE Dean and supervising senior administrator, the interviews would be conducted on the same day. However, in one case, the pair of interviews occurred four days apart.

The constant comparative method was used in the data collection and incorporated as ongoing analysis (Patton, 1990). The data from each participant pair of Dean and supervising senior administrator were compared, regarding the three themes that were studied, with the same lens as with the other two pair. It was apparent that personal development laid the foundation for the individuals' character development. Past education was another influence on the participants, as well as the continuing educational and professional goals. The third perspective considered for each participant pair was that of mentoring and networking.

Once all of the interviews were conducted, the data were organized into groups that represented like answers, providing different perspectives to the central issues (Dye, Schatz, Rosenberg, & Coleman, 2000). For each Dean and the supervising senior administrator, the data were organized according to these three converging themes. There were recurring regularities among the data collected from interviews, observations, notes,
and institutional documents. These were the ‘internal homogeneous’ criteria that represented regularities, such as career longevity in community colleges, across the data; also observed were some irregularities, such as the kinds of family influences, which spoke to the idea that there was ‘external heterogeneity’ (Patton, 1990, p. 403). These irregularities were analyzed inductively as idiosyncratic or individual experiences that each variance in interview responses, institutional documents, observations, and field notes represented. One example of such a variance was found in an interview with one supervising senior administrator who, in response to the question about the influence of mentors, stated that he learned what not to do from a poor supervisor.

Once the data gathering process was established, data collection began. Creswell (2003) identified four basic types of data collection: observations, interviews, documents, and audiovisual materials. Primary data collection for this case study research occurred in the natural setting of each community college campus where the Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators worked. Creswell’s four types of data collection were utilized as follows:

Observations

Observations were made during each interview, to add to and enrich the data. Body language, amount of time allotted for the interview, and whether interruptions were permitted, for example, contributed to the body of information that lent meaning, both in support and contradiction of, what was explicitly stated. Other observations, such as the interpersonal dynamics among faculty, staff, students, and administrators during the visits, gave the researcher a snapshot of the campus atmosphere and culture.
Interviews

The semi-structured interviews (Appendix A and B) were conducted to give the researcher an opportunity to listen to what and how administrators addressed the research questions. This data source provided the bulk of data for the analysis and outcomes of the study.

Documents

Field notes were written after each interview and contact with the participants. The field notes provided data that was viewed through the researcher's perspective, and provided information that enriched other data and also lent to the outcomes of the study. Curriculum vitae and job descriptions were compared for how well they matched in terms of expectations and consistency, as well as for comparing the data for one Dean of CTE with another and Deans of CTE with their academic counterparts. The strategic plans were compared with each institution's human resource or professional development activities for administrators and succession planning, as well as for comparing the data across institutions. Additional documents that were offered by the participants were reviewed and considered for the study.

Audiovisual Materials

The audio taped interviews were transcribed in confidence by a professional transcriber (Appendix C). The interview data were reviewed and returned to participants to be checked for accuracy and revision. Having the audio recorder freed the researcher to focus on listening and observing participants as they answered the interview questions, rather than having to write excessive notes or attempting to recall answers after the
conclusion of the interviews. Simultaneously with the member checks, field notes, institutional documents, and the transcribed data were organized, analyzed, and reviewed for themes and trends.

Member checks involved the return of transcribed interviews to the respective participants so that they had an opportunity to revise and edit their answers, further clarifying the data for the researcher. The original data were modified in some cases to reflect participants’ minor revisions.

Research Procedures

Multiple approaches were used to answer the research questions. Semi-structured interviews, observations, audio recordings with permission of the Deans and supervising senior administrators, institutional documents, and professional documents of Deans of CTE allowed the data to answer the research questions. Prior to the actual interviews with participants, a panel of experts comprised of current or former Deans of CTE programs and other community college administrators not otherwise participating in the proposed study were consulted via email and asked to provide feedback to refine the interview questions and the demographic survey (Appendix D).

Semi-structured interviews with Deans of CTE and with their supervising senior administrators were conducted, as well as studying observations, audio recordings, and field notes, for each guiding question. Human resource documents, such as job descriptions, were analyzed to determine the essential abilities and experiences required of Deans of CTE. Such documents were compared with the demographic surveys and descriptions that the Dean participants provided about their positions.
The audio data were professionally transcribed, coded, and then analyzed. Following each interview, field notes were written to detail observations of the participants during the interviews. Both the interview and field notes were reviewed and coded with the transcribed data. Prior to the interviews, a brief questionnaire (Appendix E) was administered to the Deans of CTE to gather demographic information about them to compare backgrounds and other experiences among the cases being studied.

**Participant Selection**

Deans of CTE and the supervising senior administrators were recruited by telephoning or emailing the researcher's colleagues among early childhood administrators of laboratory schools or demonstration centers for the Early Childhood Education (ECE) Academic Programs in community colleges, the researcher's dissertation advisor, and fellow doctoral students.

Once the qualifying Deans of CTE and supervising senior administrators were identified, they were first contacted by the ECE lab administrator, and then were called and/or emailed an invitation to be personally interviewed for the study. After participants informally agreed to the research, a formal letter of invitation that also served as a letter of agreement, explaining the research and the expectations of the participants, were sent as an email attachment to the prospective participants; they were asked to sign and return the agreements to the researcher (Appendix E). From the Deans of CTE, current curriculum vitae were also requested. In case the agreement document was not returned to the researcher prior to the interviews, the researcher brought paper copies of the formal letter to the interviews to be completed at that time.
Participants were selected from community colleges in the Midwest which were accessible to the researcher. One urban, one suburban, and one rural community college were selected to conduct this research. The purpose of choosing a diverse range of community college settings was to collect information from different populations through which comparisons among Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators could be made.

Three Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators were interviewed in as many colleges. The Deans of CTE were in their positions or the position of associate Dean for a minimum of three years. The supervising senior administrators were in their positions as either vice president or president for a minimum of three years and had supervised the Dean of CTE for a minimum of one year.

In advance of the semi-structured interviews, the interview questions were forwarded as attachments to email messages. Curriculum vitae were requested from participating Deans of CTE to examine the kind and frequency of research, publications, presentations, and other professional activities beyond routine job expectations in which each Dean had participated. Additionally, job descriptions, institutional documents, such as mission statements, strategic plans, and any professional development systems for senior administrators were collected from the institutions. Field notes, both observational and reflective, were composed after each interview or correspondence with participants to further enrich the research. Upon completion of the interview transcripts, responses were forwarded to participants for member checks (Lincoln & Guba, 1985).
Trustworthiness and Credibility

Trustworthiness of the data and its collection process were critical to the study and its findings. Christensen and Johnson (2004) discussed trustworthiness in terms of a study being “plausible, credible, and therefore defensible” (p. 249), and therefore as having credibility. This study demonstrated trustworthiness by maximizing validity through specific strategies. One such strategy was that the researcher was careful to use the lenses of the participants to understand their “inner worlds” (Christensen & Johnson, 2004, p. 251).

Another strategy used in this study was to conduct research in a natural setting, thereby enabling the researcher to focus closely on details about the individual participants and their workplaces to similarly experience the community college context with the participants (Creswell, 2003). As the data converged, meaning was expanded “through the overlapping, compatible constructions emanating from differing vantage points” (Bruce, 2003, p. 48).

Finally, the research was trustworthy because the transcribed interviews were returned to participants for feedback. This member check permitted participants the opportunity to clarify their responses to interview questions and therefore allowed refinement of the research data.

Data Analysis

The data analysis involved careful review of the material and documents. Raw data from the interviews were transcribed and returned to participants for member checks. Simultaneously, a process of organizing or coding the data occurred. As the data
were coded, patterns or themes emerged and were interpreted. Data were reviewed repeatedly, coded again by themes, and eventually narrowed down to Stake's (1995) emic or prime characteristics: a detailed picture of what Deans of CTE leadership looked like, how the Deans' of CTE abilities and attributes were developed, and how Deans of CTE might become part of institutional succession planning.

To assist the researcher in the organizing and coding process, an audit trail was maintained and available for use as needed (Lincoln & Guba, 1985), meaning that all documentation was organized and stored in a way that it continued to be accessible and retrievable for subsequent reference. All data and documents were kept confidential and maintained in a locked file in the researcher's home.

**Essential Leadership Practices in CTE**

To collect data to address the research question related to "essential leadership practices required for success as a CTE Dean," participating Deans of CTE were asked the following questions during the interviews:

1. What are the essential leadership practices needed by Deans of career and technical education (CTE) in community colleges, such as developing an inclusive and democratic team among diverse program faculty and staff needs?
2. What formal education did you have that prepared you for this leadership role?
3. What work and life experiences did you have that prepared you for this leadership role?
4. Do the expectations of the position and career path for the CTE Dean differ from those of other Deans? If so, how are they different? How is the position like other
Deans' positions?

To collect data related to “essential leadership practices required for success as a Dean of CTE,” the following questions were asked of supervising senior administrators:

1. What are the essential leadership practices needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

2. How are your expectations of Deans of CTE like those for other Deans?

3. How are your expectations of Deans of CTE different from those for other Deans?

4. Before you became a supervising senior administrator, what leadership position(s) in community colleges did you have and how might these experience have influenced your views concerning the CTE Dean position?

Essential Abilities

To collect data to address the research question related to “essential abilities required for success as a CTE Dean,” participating Deans of CTE were asked the following questions during the interviews:

1. Now that you have been in the position for over a year, what kinds of abilities have you found that are like what you previously anticipated?

2. How is the job as CTE Dean different from that of other Deans?

3. What other kinds of support or guidance would have been helpful to prepare you to be a successful administrator or career Dean?

To collect data related to “essential abilities required for success as a CTE Dean,” the following questions were asked of supervising senior administrators:
“What are the personal abilities you seek in a new Dean of Career and Technical Education (CTE), and why are they important to you?’

1. How are your expectations of Deans of CTE like those for other Deans?
2. How are your expectations of Deans of CTE different from those for other Deans?

Essential Experiences

To collect data to address the research question related to ‘essential experiences’ required for success as a CTE Dean,” participating Deans of CTE were asked the following questions during the interviews:

1. What made you think you had the knowledge and experience for this leadership role?
2. How is the job as Dean of CTE different from that of other Deans?
3. Who were the people that influenced you to pursue the responsibilities of Dean of CTE?
4. Who were the people that helped to prepare you for the responsibilities of Dean of CTE?
5. What other kinds of support or guidance would have been helpful to prepare you to be a successful administrator or Dean of CTE?

To collect data to address the research question related to “essential experiences’ required for success as a Dean of CTE,” participating supervising senior administrators were asked the following questions during the interviews:

1. How are your expectations of Deans of CTE like those for other Deans?
2. How are your expectations of Deans of CTE different from those for other Deans?

3. What kind and how much support or guidance do you expect to give a Dean of CTE to make him or her an important part of your leadership team, vies-a-vie as the degree to which you apprise the Dean of CTE about the academic divisions or programs and expect the CTE Dean to be involved with the academic Deans?

**Succession Planning Strategies**

To collect data to address the research question related to “succession planning strategies required for success as a CTE Dean,” participating Deans of CTE were asked the following questions during the interviews:

1. What other kinds of support or guidance would have been helpful to prepare you to be a successful administrator or Dean of CTE?

2. What skills, besides the ones already discussed, do you think you need to further develop and enhance your career mobility?

To collect data to address the research question related to “succession planning strategies required for success as a CTE Dean,” participating supervising senior administrators were asked the following questions during the interviews:

1. What kind and how much support or guidance do you expect to give a Dean of CTE to make him or her an important part of your leadership team, vies-a-vie as the degree to which you apprise the Dean of CTE about the academic divisions or programs and expect the CTE Dean to be involved with the academic Deans?
2. How do you support a Dean of CTE to promote his or her career mobility, such as advancing to senior administration?

Transferability and Reflexivity

The researcher is a tool of the research, creating meaning from the lens through which she perceives data and the new meaning she constructs about it. According to Stake (1995), patterns, themes, and events that are duplicated in diverse settings enable the researcher to draw conclusions about a particular pool of participants. “The naturalist researcher looks for confirmability rather than objectivity establishing the value of the data” (Creswell, 2007, p. 204). The researcher reflects on observations and thick descriptions from the multiple cases and confirms meaning in this process (Stake, 1995). Thus, the researcher influences the study and is inseparable from the research process and findings.

The researcher in this study reflected on her own biases, values, and interests, otherwise referred to as reflexivity (Creswell, 2003). “Reflexivity means that the writer is conscious of the biases, values, and experiences that she brings to a qualitative research study. The writer makes this explicit in the text” (Creswell, 2007, pp. 243-244). For this study, the researcher's view was based on experience as early childhood manager and early childhood education academic program adjunct faculty member of a career program for almost ten years, in a middle sized, suburban community college. During her tenure, she worked directly with multiple Deans of CTE programs. The different experiences with a variety of Deans of CTE influenced how the researcher perceived the role and practice of the Deans of CTE.
Chapter Summary

A qualitative case study was conducted to explore the essential practices, abilities, attributes, experiences, and succession planning strategies that were necessary for community college Deans of CTE to be effective leaders. The research questions for the study were used to conduct semi-structured interviews with Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators. Institutional documents, such as mission statements, strategic plans, job descriptions for the Deans of CTE, and available professional development plans for leadership were reviewed and compared.

Participants were in their positions for a specifically defined period of time, bounding the study. To triangulate the research, a variety of means to collect data were used: institutional and professional documents; detailed field notes; transcribed interviews that were based on audio recordings and then submitted for member checks; and researcher observations. The data were analyzed through a system of coding and recoding so that eventually the essential answers to the research questions funneled down to a few critical themes: personal attributes and background factors; formal education and professional development; and mentoring and networking. It was through the researcher's reflective process that the data were interpreted, themes were identified, and outcomes were articulated.

The following chapters provide details of what data were collected, findings, and a summary of what impact this research has on the field. Data were collected through a series of semi-structured interviews and by using institutional and professional documents to find themes that addressed the guiding questions of the research. These
themes were analyzed and summarized so that the findings led to inferences and
suggested applications to future practices of aspiring and current Deans of CTE and their
supervising senior administrators. First the collected data is presented. The findings are
explained in terms of the study participants and their college contexts. Then the
conclusion and recommendations for practice and for future research are discussed.

CHAPTER 4
FINDINGS
Introduction

Chapter 4 presents the data that were collected for the research, introduced by a restatement of the purpose, guiding questions, and a description of the study protocol, including how participants were chosen. Demographic data about the participants and their respective campuses are described in Tables 1, 2, and 3. Next, the emergent and *a priori* themes relevant to the data are explained briefly. Interview data from each of the three cases follow, and finally, the data from the cases are related to each of the guiding questions. Studying the data collected from participants, from their institutions, and from the literature, together, answers to the guiding questions emerge and rejoin the purpose of exploring the leadership practices of Deans of CTE and the succession plans of their institutions.

Purpose

The purpose of this study was to explore the strategic leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies used by exemplary community college Deans. This research explored the experiences and processes that led each Dean of CTE to his or her current position. Further, it delved into what role the Dean of CTE might have in the succession planning structure within the community college.

Data collection was organized by formal educational experiences, professional development and networking experiences, and personal kinds of experiences as they related to the individual self-reported attributes and practices of the participants, particularly from the Deans, as well as from institutional documents, such as strategic plans and job descriptions. Also used were the data collected from the supervising senior
administrators to analyze how the Deans' self-reports aligned with the expectations and aspirations of their supervising administrators. Thus, self-reports were compared with institutional expectations and supervisors’ expectations to explore in depth the leadership practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies of the Deans in their natural contexts.

**Guiding Questions**

To frame the research study so that the purpose was accomplished, a qualitative multi-case study was conducted. Answers to key questions were explored with Deans of Career and Technical Education and their supervising senior administrators. The experiences and processes that led each Dean of CTE to his current position were reviewed. It was assumed that there were similarities and differences in the career paths among different Deans of CTE. Further, it was important to triangulate the data by viewing those career paths in the context of the Deans' of CTE career trajectories, the expectations of their supervising senior administrators, and the similarities and differences that existed between Deans of CTE and other Deans in the community college.

Six guiding questions were used to collect the data for this research. These questions probed the personal attributes and abilities of successful Deans of CTE; the educational background and experience the Deans of CTE had; the kind of support or mentoring Deans of CTE had in terms of their career mobility; and the comparison of the succession planning strategies of Deans of CTE with other Deans in the same institution. The questions that guided this research were articulated:
1. What are the essential leadership practices needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

2. What are the essential abilities needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

3. What are the essential experiences needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

4. What essential succession planning strategies are needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

5. How do the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE differ from those practices, abilities, and planning strategies for other academic Deans? How are the practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies the same?

6. How do supervising senior administrators facilitate or inhibit the professional development and career mobility of Deans of CTE?

**Research Protocol**

To answer these questions, a multiple case study was conducted with three Deans of Career and Technical Education, paired with their supervising senior administrators on their respective campuses. The Deans had been in their positions for at least three years, and the supervising senior administrators had been in their positions for at least three to five years.

Semi-structured interviews were conducted with Deans of Career and Technical Education programs that included the early childhood academic program and the lab
school, and each Dean's supervising senior administrator on the respective campuses at three Midwestern community colleges: one rural, one suburban, and one urban. The colleges and participants were identified on the basis of the researcher's network within the early childhood professional community, with support from the researcher's dissertation chair. The director of each lab or demonstration center was contacted first, to inquire about whether the prospective participants met the research criteria of the ECE academic program and also the length of time the Dean and his up line administrator had worked in each position. Each lab school director made an initial contact with the Dean of the CTE program and inquired about the Dean's willingness to participate. In turn, once the Dean agreed to participate, that individual recruited the supervising senior administrator, an academic vice president in two cases and a president in the third case, for the study.

The qualitative case study data were culled from semi-structured interviews with Deans of Career and Technical Education and their supervising senior administrators; institutional documents; and observations and field notes. All of the participant pairs were interviewed in the natural settings of their respective institutions. Documents were obtained from the participants, the human resource departments, and from the web sites of each college.

Each Dean participant was identified by the researcher's professional network in early childhood education, and with help from the dissertation chair and a classmate. Priority was given to institutions that had early childhood education programs with related demonstration centers or labs over which the Dean participant had direct
responsibility. To further enrich the data, participants from Midwestern colleges in one rural, one suburban, and one urban area were used to explore whether location played a role in how Deans of CTE achieved their positions and practiced leadership. The Deans in two cases had both transfer and career programs under their administration, while one Dean's responsibilities were bound by the numerous Career and Technical Education programs in his college.

The data from each administrative pair and college were collected and compared with like data from the other two participants and colleges. Three emergent themes were then related to two previously published leadership development concepts or a priori themes, Hersey and Blanchard's situational leadership (Hersey et al., 2008) and work-based learning (Raelin, 1997). The data are presented first by case profiles; and then by participant responses that are organized by emergent and a prior themes. Case findings are then presented by each of the guiding questions. The chapter concludes with a summary of the findings and with a look towards chapter five, in which the findings are discussed, conclusions are drawn, and implications are inferred, and recommendations are suggested.

**Emergent and A Priori Themes**

Data analysis revealed three emergent themes to which three a priori themes, emanating from the literature and research, were applied. The three major themes emerging from the data analysis were as follows: (a) personal attributes and background factors, (b) formal education and professional development factors, and (c) mentoring and networking factors. The three a priori themes included (a) essential practices,
abilities, attributes; (b) mentoring and networking; (c) situational leadership theory (Hersey, 1984), and additionally, the concept of work-based learning (Raelin, 1997). This chapter presents the findings from participants at one rural, one suburban, and one urban community college, following a brief introduction of each case participant and a description of the context in which they work.

Participants

Participants for this research were selected based on having administrative oversight of an early childhood education academic program with an early childhood education lab or demonstration center for the academic students. Such criteria were chosen because the researcher's background was in early childhood education in a community college as both a manager of demonstration centers and as adjunct faculty. This experience lent credibility to the researcher as one with knowledge of both the transfer and CTE aspects of a community college. A second reason that the early childhood programs were used for the study was because these programs represent a typical model of a Career and Technical Education program.

Institutional documents were also used to help identify the common themes that emerged from the interviews. Thus, the research represented multiple perspectives of Deans, supervising senior administrators, and those documents that related to the research questions, such as college strategic plans and specific job descriptions for Deans of Career and Technical Education. The transcribed interviews and the institutional documents were analyzed to cull common themes from the data.
While the early childhood education academic program was also a transfer program, the participants of this study had responsibility for the demonstration centers as part of Career and Technical Education. Thus, even though two of the Deans who participated were administrators for transfer programs as well as for the CTE programs, they nonetheless met the criteria for this research.

Table 1

*Participant Location and Pseudonym*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Participants</th>
<th>Location</th>
<th>Pseudonyms</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Dean of Career and Technical Education</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>DR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervising senior administrator</td>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>SSAR</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dean of Career and Technical Education</td>
<td>Suburban</td>
<td>DS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervising senior administrator</td>
<td>Suburban</td>
<td>SSAS</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dean of Career and Technical Education</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>DU</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Supervising senior administrator</td>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>SSAU</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Each of the participants and the corresponding community colleges were given pseudonyms to ensure confidentiality. Table 1 identifies pseudonyms for the Deans of Career and Technical Education, their supervising senior administrators, and the location of their institutions. While each participant had a different title, for the purpose of this study, all of the middle level administrators with oversight of Career and Technical Education programs including early childhood education were referred to as “Deans.”
Before the interview questions were posed, demographic data were collected from the Deans, including their current position title; length of time in the current position; in which departments they had worked and/or supervised, for how long, and in which specific area; and any business or industry experience. Comparative data among the Deans of Career and Technical Education programs are summarized in Table 2.

Table 2

*Participant Demographic Data*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Current title/time in position by location</th>
<th>Education</th>
<th>Types of programs supervise(d)</th>
<th>Career/technical experience not academe</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural: Associate Dean of Health and Human Services/10 years</td>
<td>BAN, MS, EdD</td>
<td>CTE; transfer</td>
<td>None</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburban: Dean of Career Programs/8 years</td>
<td>BS, MS, ABD (PhD 2010)</td>
<td>CTE; transfer; Workforce</td>
<td>Nursing; business owner</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban: Dean of Instruction/3 years</td>
<td>BS, MA, ABD (EdD 2009)</td>
<td>CTE; transfer; developmental</td>
<td>Corporate consulting</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Additionally, institutional documents were reviewed to cull data regarding how the college's mission and strategic plan might respond to the research purpose and guiding questions. Each institution did articulate the idea of professional development in its
mission statement and/or strategic plan. The human resource department of the suburban community college provided an annual schedule of professional development opportunities that were specifically for administrators. According to the human resource offices of the rural and the urban colleges, the institutions were currently working to articulate succession planning strategies, but to date, had none to share. The Dean of the rural college stated that at a recent board meeting, the necessity for developing such a plan existed and would be addressed. With regard for additional institutional documents that might respond to the research, only one college (suburban) provided one such document. Table 3 illustrates which documents from the three institutions were added to the data.

Case Profiles

Three Dean and their supervising senior administrators were selected for this study from three large community colleges in the Midwest. The participants represented one rural, one suburban, and one urban college, all of which had student populations of at least 15,000, with Career and Technical Education programs in over thirty fields. For the purpose of identifying participants, each of the community colleges had an early childhood education academic program as one model of a career program, with an accompanying demonstration center or lab.

The districts in which the community colleges were located had over 150,000 to 750,000 residents, with the rural having the fewest and the urban having the most. It was noteworthy that at the urban college, only about 2% of the students were enrolled in
Career and Technical Education programs, with the greatest emphasis being on Adult Basic

Table 3

Comparative Institutional Documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community college</th>
<th>Mission statement/ Current strategic plan</th>
<th>Structured plan for administrators’ career development and mobility</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rural</td>
<td>“We support, and expect, professional growth of all employees.”</td>
<td>Idea raised in recent meeting of Board of Trustees, but structure not in place at this time.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburban</td>
<td>“Committed to employees’ roles and assume responsibility to strengthen knowledge through professional development opportunities and collaborative and effective working experiences.”</td>
<td>Eight Expectations for Professionalism: Be team players. Be risk takers. Be self-starters. Be positive, upbeat, optimistic. Be able to set vision for his/her area. Focus on students, student learning, and student success. Understand communication is essential to effective teaching.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Table 3 (Continued)

Comparative Institutional Documents

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Community college</th>
<th>Mission statement/</th>
<th>Structured plan for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>District</td>
<td>Current strategic plan</td>
<td>Administrators’ career development and mobility</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-------------------</td>
<td>----------------------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-----------------------------------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Suburban</td>
<td>continuous improvement.</td>
<td>Get along with people.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Know use of power, control, and ego must be avoided.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td></td>
<td>Workshops for administrators offered through year.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Urban</td>
<td>“Develop and retain the highest quality community college workforce.”</td>
<td>The system beginning to look at succession planning, but to date, no structure in place.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>“Develop a staff development plan based on continuous quality improvement and enhancing work performance.”</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

Education (ABE) programs, while the same college also had the largest CTE program of all colleges in its district.

**Rural Community College (RCC)**

The public rural community college was located just outside of a university town in the Midwest. Its student population was between 15,000 and 20,000 per year, with almost half enrolled in CTE courses. The total population of the public community college district numbered between 150,000 and 200,000. The college offered programs in approximately 50 career fields.

**Suburban Community College (SCC)**
The public suburban community college had an enrollment of over 30,000 credit and noncredit students in a district of over 350,000 residents. Of the total number of students, thirty-three percent were enrolled in career programs. There were over 100 career programs offered by the suburban community college. The suburban community college was the only one of the three cases that demonstrated an existing plan for administrators' professional development and succession planning. Table 3 showed how the three cases compared with regard for any claim of institutional support in its mission statement or strategic plan for administrative role development and existing infrastructure to support the plan. All three institutions articulated support in their documents, but there was only one aforementioned case in which the plan had been formally implemented.

**Urban Community College (UCC)**

The public urban community college was a part of a multiple-college district in the Midwest. The total district population was over 750,000. Interestingly, about one-half of the 20,000 to 30,000 students having unduplicated enrollment in this urban college were identified as being in one of the adult basic education (ABE) programs. Further, fewer than 2% of the enrollment reflected students of the college's approximately 50 Career and Technical Education programs. Yet, the CTE programs clearly weighed heavily in college priorities, as demonstrated by the institutional interview data, the budget dedicated to those CTE programs, and the findings of this study. As previously noted, the same college has the largest CTE program of all the career and technical programs offered in the district.

**Case Findings by Theme**
The three general themes that emerged from the data were (a) formal education and professional development; (b) personal attributes and background factors; and (c) mentoring and networking. Interview data from each case is presented below, organized first by the institution and then by the three themes, and presented in the same sequential (a-b-c) order. After the emergent themes are described, *a priori* themes derived from the research and literature are reviewed. Formal education and professional development include academic experiences and related professional or work-related experiences that the participants have had while in various positions. Mentoring and networking are activities that the participants have experienced either within their positions or outside of their home institutions, and with regard for a couple of specific situations, it also includes activities that involved certain experiences with specific family members. Personal attributes and background factors are ascribed to personality or character qualities and experiences, with emphasis on, but not exclusively, childhood experiences and larger family influences.

The *a priori* themes follow at the end of each case and are presented in relation to the situational leadership theory model (Hersey et al., 2008) and the work-based learning model (Raelin, 1997). Situational leadership and work-based learning were discussed in chapter two, and in this chapter, are used to explain how supervising senior administrators and the Deans of Career and Technical Education work together in such a way that the Dean's leadership abilities and practices grew in the current position. In situational leadership, the supervisor assesses the Dean's level of competence and the degree of motivation to strategize how much and what kind of guidance he gives the
supervisee. In the work-based learning model, the focus is on the supervisee first, and then on the larger context of supervisor and program, department, or institution.

First the rural case is presented followed by the suburban and urban cases. Within each case presentation, the Dean's responses are presented first, followed by the supervising senior administrator's responses. Finally, the \textit{a priori} themes are presented.

**Rural Community College (RCC) Case Findings by Themes**

**Formal Education and Professional Development Factors: Emergent Theme #1**

**Rural Dean (DR).** When asked about how formal education and professional development helped DR accomplish the leadership position, he attributed his career mobility to some of the basic career education, which fostered skills in communication, organization, critical thinking, and decision-making. The master's degree gave a “jump start” to DR's leadership education because of practicum experiences that involved site visits and opportunities for networking with colleagues. Most of all, the doctoral education in leadership in community college were extremely helpful.

When the current supervising senior administrator came to the rural college, there was not a lot of support for the collaborative nature of the Deans. During the former supervising senior administrator's tenure, “camaraderie and support that we could have provided each other early on was stifled. That was one reason I looked for a doctoral program because I knew that I needed more support in some way or maybe knowledge about how things went.” While some previous graduate courses were relevant to the position, it was not until DR was actually in the leadership role that reflection about what was learned in school had a part in current leadership style and skills. DR found that such
hindsight validated the already practiced skills and style of leadership in the Dean of CTE programs position.

**Rural supervising senior administrator (SSAR).** When asked what attributes were important for a Dean of CTE, SSAR said that the Dean needed to be conversant enough about the programs in his areas to speak intelligently about the subject and to evaluate the faculty members effectively. “Faculty members expect to be able to carry on an intelligent conversation with their leader.”

The second attribute that SSAR wished to see Deans of CTE spend time developing was the ability to assess and discuss good teaching styles.

We should all be up on and conversant with what constitutes effective teaching, whether it's the face-to-face classroom or whether it's an online section or a hybrid section or you name it. Because really, that's our mission—to provide excellence in instruction.

**Personal Attributes and Background Factors: Emergent Theme #2**

**Rural Dean.** DR was quick to state that an aura of confidence needs to be displayed, simultaneously with a degree of humility, as necessary personal attributes to be successful as the Dean of CTE. DR further described that the Dean of CTE needs to be approachable, to be willing to work hard, and to be organized. It was important to trust people to get their own job done, and to not micromanage. It was important to have critical thinking and problem-solving skills.

DR was the eldest of a large farm family, which meant there was a lot of responsibility placed on him. His mother was always working, so DR was left in charge of overseeing that the siblings got their chores finished. “We grew up in an environment where everybody had to work to get it all done.” DR discovered that the experiences of
undertaking familial responsibilities led to early maturity and the development of confidence and leadership skills.

The Dean in the rural community college said that it is important to look at oneself to see if one “can be open to lots of different ways of doing things.” He encourages and supports staff to grow in the areas in which they express interest.

I think that’s important. If a faculty member were interested in that I would try to cultivate their working with the community more; try to encourage them to be involved in leadership, either workshops or coursework if that’s what they’re interested in, but fostering those kinds of experiences for them. Any opportunity that they could to just expand their world and their discipline if it were a faculty member. I would encourage. In the radiography program, we have two full-time faculty. One full-time faculty member just wants to teach, and that’s what his love is and he’s fine at it. The other one is interested in those committee assignments, finding out what’s going on in the college. So I really try to support both of those people in the things that they like to do. Louise is very interested in being involved in our AQIP committees. She’s got some very strong leadership qualities. So I encourage her to do those kinds of things as well.

Rural supervising senior administrator. With regard for personal attributes, SSAR emphasized two personal traits that he expected of the Dean of CTE as well as of other Deans. The first was intelligence; he felt it important that the Deans be “intellectually stimulating.” The other attribute was about the energy that a Dean brings to the position.

One of the qualities that I’ve always prized is enthusiasm. I think we generally find that among our administrator leadership. There’s real commitment and concern for students and for their learning and for their success, as well as a real love for education and enthusiasm at being part of this.

Mentoring and Networking Factors: Emergent Theme #3

Rural Dean. Besides the diversity of experiences with colleagues and co-workers, DR was influenced by the previous Dean of instruction, who was supportive. Even more so, family was supportive of pursuing the Dean-level position. Personally, DR stated that
his mother was influential to the extent that “she's someone [DR] could talk to.” DR stated that both his mother and sister, a Dean in a university, had promoted his self-confidence about pursuing the role of Dean of Career and Technical Education programs.

[My] mother is a person who you can talk to about situations. And she will ask you the hard questions, you know. What you think about it and how it affects you. And does it really matter? She's also a real forgive and forget kind of person and that would always be something. You know, well, what does this really matter? How long do you have to hang on to that? Is it really important?

Regarding the professional networking influences, DR expressed that, prior to assuming the role, he did not have an understanding of how important the extent of support needed from colleagues would be, nor how to advocate for it once he was in the position.

There was significant turmoil as the college moved forward to establish the faculty union. Most of the English instructors were truly academics. That is what their job has been. They have been in higher education. So they really haven't had some of that job experience that some of the people in the career areas have had. So that, I think, affects how they, what their expectations of the job are. So I think that would probably be the one thing I didn't really have an understanding for how much we would need each other, those of us who were in a similar position. I don't know if I could have, I would have known that, since that position was new.

Also, when DR was confronted with the issue of the colleague who had similarly applied for the Dean's position and who demonstrated challenging behaviors and attitudes subsequent to being overlooked for the Dean's job, DR reflected that more confidence would have been helpful.

I probably suffered that alone and I probably didn't need to. Some of those things might have even been close to insubordination but I didn't maybe recognize that for what it was at the time. So maybe just some confidence in going to other people with some of those things might have been something I might have benefited from. And honestly, I think, men and women probably would deal with that a little differently. I probably internalize it a little more, you know, as a
woman. And I'm not sure that I felt comfortable even talking about those things necessarily with some of my male colleagues either.

It was DR's perception that the male counterparts were not necessarily interested in such human resource and supervision issues; "it seemed deep."

To promote the position, the person 'needs to be involved in some committee work' that is not necessarily directly related to the current position. Another area in which the role might be considered significant was with the foundation activities. Expounding further, the Dean said,

The way that we do that is get good people in our positions of program coordinators so that they can deal with these day-to-day things quite well so that the Deans or associate Deans in these positions can really--it's networking. Being out there and networking with the people who are going to be involved in making those kinds of decisions and that would probably build confidence in the ability to aspire to those VP positions or president positions.

Rural supervising senior administrator. SSAR expects the Deans who have CTE responsibilities to work frequently and collaboratively with the other Deans and administrators. He expects them to share responsibility for making difficult decisions, especially when facing a tight budget as is the current situation. He referred to his expectation of their involvement with the other Deans as 'completely' and 'very intertwined.'

Boy, I had a really good boss at my college back in [Midwest college], who gave me several boosts when I was kind of a green administrator. He was the Dean. And one of the first things he did to give me a kind of a hand-up was to involve me in helping to write the NCA accreditation report for our part of the college. And we worked together on that and became friendly and he encouraged me to seek promotion within that college, which worked out well. And after coming here to this college 15 years ago or so, I benefited from the leadership of the person who was in this office, who is now president at [another community college]. And I was given a lot of encouragement also by our president, whose office is right next to us here. One of the things [is] that you work with people and
you develop a sense of whether or not your work is effective. And so I would say that I learned a lot about whether or not, or I learned a lot about what to do or how to do it from my colleagues who I supervised. There was a French general, I think one of Napoleon's generals, who said, talking about leadership, “Those are my soldiers, I must follow them.” And that's a little bit like what that quote from Lao Tzu, you know, you trust people to do the right thing. You trust them to develop good practices. And you participate in that. Seeing successes emerge from that kind of work myself, I developed more confidence in myself as a leader or someone who might be effective in this position.

Conversely, SSAR described the influence of the first administrator for whom he worked in a community college as being “absolutely the worst leader you could name.” Everyone hated that particular administrator and SSAR “almost quit a number of times because I couldn't stand him, so I learned to model the opposite of his behavior.” In a way, he was a very valuable mentor in that regard, because SSAR learned what not to do. “As a result, the department was rather dysfunctional and there was a lot of resentment about his style of leadership. So I learned from that. It was important to see firsthand what doesn't work.”

A Priori Themes Related to Rural Community College Findings

Both DR and SSAR spoke to issues that reflected Hersey and Blanchard's (Hersey et al., 2008) situational leadership theory, as well as Raelin's (1997) work-based learning model. With regard for the situational leadership theory, DR was influenced first by a supervisor that did not value collaboration, which led to a degree of isolation. Conversely, when the current supervisor assumed his position and encouraged collaboration, DR was nurtured and grew from the formal and ongoing collaboration with SSAR and with peers. In this case, the supervising senior administrator assessed the Deans in terms of intelligence, collaborative skills, and enthusiasm, reflecting the
supervisor assessment strategy described in situational leadership. With regard for
Raelin's work-based learning model, DR described the importance of the development of
his leadership strategies relative to his involvement with peers, even more than with
SSAR. However, SSAR emphasized his expectation of continuous collaboration among
all of the Deans and himself that was grounded in the institutional mission but was
accomplished through the day-to-day, routine collaboration of goal-setting and problem-
solving. Thus, the rural case lends support for the community aspect of Raelin's work-
based learning model.

Suburban Community College (SCC) Case Findings by Themes

Formal Education and Professional Development Factors: Emergent Theme #1

Suburban Dean. The Dean in the suburban community college (DS) responded to
the questions about his formal education and professional development by referring to the
need to look at the ‘big picture;’ the ability to ‘think on your feet;’ to be very flexible; to
relate to and actually like people; to be versatile; and because DS has oversight of four
programs, the Dean feels that it is important to be uniquely responsive to those programs’
four cultures and issues.

DS found the master's degree in education relevant for the position because it led
to his own role of faculty and the understanding of faculty issues. More so than the
formal education, DS was inclined to view that the on-the-job experience was better
preparation for the leadership role, however.

DS expressed that the areas in which he felt he could have used more guidance
were in budgeting and in human resources. Regarding the budget:
It's always been something that I have put on the back burner. I think probably more preparation in budgeting would have helped. I did have it. I knew budgeting from [another college]. When I came here, I didn't have hands-on budgeting for a long time here because the Dean did it. And I just didn't, that wasn't one of my responsibilities. It was minimal is what I would say. So in taking over as Dean that's one of the things that I really have to make myself do, is spend more time on the budget part of it. I'm involving the new assistant Dean a lot more than I was involved. And that's helping both of us."

The human resource issues were the other area in which DS expressed a desire for more guidance prior to assuming the position as Dean of CTE. "I'm learning a lot of HR issues that I didn't know before. Hiring processes that I didn't know about as assistant Dean, HR policies that I'm learning kind of as you go."

The suburban Dean responded to the question about what made him think he was qualified to be Dean of CTE programs after reflection. He stated that having taught in the community college was helpful to feeling qualified for the position; one knows faculty issues if one has been one. Having practiced in a caring or service field, "dealing with a whole lot of people" contributed to DS's perception that he was qualified. Lastly, having a family history with lots of teachers who valued education as being important further contributed to DS's belief in being qualified for the position of Dean of CTE programs.

**Suburban supervising senior administrator.** When asked about his expectations of the Dean of CTE, SSAS responded quickly and did not hesitate in discussing the attributes and abilities he valued. He focused on the aspects of the Dean's of CTE role as different from that of other Deans.

The Deans involved in the career and technical area, first of all, I expect that they maintain their programs in accordance with common practice, that they have advisory committees that meet regularly, that they know their special accreditation requirements of whatever the programs are that are under them, that they're making regular recommendations for things like the maintenance and
rotation of equipment. I expect a career and technical Dean to know how to find qualified adjuncts to support the full-timers in their programs and to support their division chairs, who really have that role. We find often it's hard to get really passionate adjuncts in a field where you can't pay them what they can make on their own if they're practicing in the profession. So you need a Dean who is always on the lookout for good adjuncts. The last thing that I would say for the person in a career and technical area is there's a responsibility there to keep ahead of developments in the fields of the programs under them, to find new programs when we need them, to change old programs, to know how to do things like a DACUM process. It's knowing that those associations are out there. It's being involved in the development of the curriculum, involving people from the trades and field in the development of those curriculum, staying abreast of the regulations.

SSAS described here how he guides the learning. In situational leadership, the emphasis is on the mentor (Hersey, 1984; Hersey et al., 2008).

Another area in which SSAS emphasized specific attributes and abilities was with regard for human resource and supervision issues, as well as for contractual issues. SSAS was adamant that he expected members of his leadership team to demonstrate an understanding of human resource management and contractual boundaries, or else he disassociated with them.

I would make sure a career and technical Dean was very aware of contractual processes relating to the promotion, retention and firing of their personnel. Sometimes that's an area I've found where, in particular, if they've come out of the business world it's a much quicker process than what you go through with tenured faculty. Well, it's still whether the Dean's, a vocational or occupational Dean or a career Dean or a transfer Dean, what you have to discover at some point is, is this person willing to apply progressive discipline and pull the trigger when it's necessary? And I've been surprised over my career to find out how many aren't. They don't last on my team. I want people who hold their staff accountable but yet support them tremendously, you know.

Relating his role as the senior administrator of the Deans, SSAS said succinctly,
“My job is to set an environment where the individual can try their decision-making out, experience the results of that, and improve it.” He elaborated about how he creates such an environment for the Deans:

I think things are important, [such as] what the office assignments are, how you're mixing people together. We had a four-person office in science. . . . What kind of professional development you ought to be encouraging the person to get? I run a Deans' council and an academic leadership team. I tend to put the Deans on joint projects because I find, you know, trust is built through time spend together doing activities. So depending on the personalities of the people, you can have some that come in and they're instant team members and you have some that are shy. Well, they're afraid. You know, they're going to be discovered, the other Deans are going to know [what] they don't know so it takes awhile to work that through.

While SSAS expressed his concern about structuring an environment that fostered leadership among the Deans, it was nonetheless unclear as to whether his tutelage was truly effective in developing the culturally proficient learning environment. LaNier (2006) determined that cultural proficiency is crucial to effective leadership. Supervising senior administrators [or supervising senior administrators] apply some elements of cultural proficiency. However, the culturally competent behaviors and practices of those same supervising senior administrators and their colleges are insufficient in developing culturally proficient learning environments. (p. 5)

Raelin (1997), approaching the mentoring relationship from a related but different lens from that of situational leadership, placed more emphasis on the learner in his work-based learning model. More consideration about these three different perspectives on mentoring will be discussed in Chapter 5.
Personal Attributes and Background Factors: Emergent Theme #2

Suburban Dean. DS had confidence about being able to perform the duties of the position because of having had previous experience as an assistant Dean. For DS, the reality of the position was consistent with expectations because of successfully handling that experience.

I think being an assistant truly did help me because it wasn't kind of a gradual recognition that, aaah, even though I don't know heating and air conditioning, da-da-da-da, [thinking that] I can't do it; I could do it! And so I kind of felt very confident when the Dean's position opened, that I had the skills to do it.

DS also emphasized the importance of an understanding family, as well as the relevance of knowing oneself and one's interests and abilities in terms of successfully meeting the requirements of the position. 'I know what I want. And this is exactly what I want to do. I like this job. I like the people that I work with. There's a whole lot more to do here. You have to know yourself. That's what I mean. You have to know yourself.'

Suburban supervising senior administrator. Related to the interview question asked of the Dean about the Dean's expectations of the position prior to assuming it, SSAS was asked how he perceived differences between the Dean of CTE and the other Deans. Specifically, he spoke to some of the challenges that the Dean of CTE faced as opposed to those of the Deans of transfer programs.

The Dean of careers has to be aware that in certain of the transfer areas, like communications or social sciences, there are a little different faculty attitudes than they're going to encounter in their own area. The trades and the programs that support them, generally, these are people who are, they're unpretentious. They're used to working with their hands or working together or working for companies. They're not used to maybe the attitudes that would be expressed by an Economics teacher or a composition teacher, who's more oriented toward the guild. Who sees themselves as more of a professoriate. Who's going to tell them, you know, "If it's not in the contract I'm not doing it," and things like that—that just don't fly on the
career and technical side. So you have to say, you know, it's not a good idea to walk in their office and tell them they're going to do it. You got to kind of (chuckles) bring them along.

**Mentoring and Networking Factors: Emergent Theme #3**

**Suburban Dean.** The suburban Dean credited mentors for helping him arrive at his current position. In particular, DS found that having come from the role of practitioner to that of instructor, and then to administrator, the mentors played an important role in his career development as a Dean of Career and Technical Education.

DS credited several mentoring experiences that contributed to preparation for the current leadership role. “If you have good mentoring when you're learning and you're watching how to be an administrator, it's easier to be a good administrator.” Further, DS emphasized the importance of the mentoring relationships in situations such as his, where the person who moves into administration or leadership from having been a practitioner and instructor. “I think it's real important when you are going from what I did. You know, I went from being a [practitioner], [career] instructor, going into the other side, going to the other side— and I don't mean that in a negative way.” The professional mentors for DS were previous supervisors or administrators at other colleges and the college where DS is currently employed. Additionally, the current supervising senior administrator of the suburban community college was identified as a current mentor.

“I feel very comfortable turning to him and saying, you, this and this. What do you think about that? So I've been lucky. Not everybody I've worked with or for has been a mentor. But I've been lucky with a lot of good ones.” Ultimately, DS credited a personal mentor
most, relating, “I had my mom, who’s been dead about ten years, but she was my primary mentor.”

DS was encouraged and supported to pursue the position by the hiring Dean, other administrators, faculty, colleagues met through professional associations, and a strong family. Among the influences in the professional arena, faculty and administrators suggested that DS as the current assistant Dean apply for the Dean's position when it became available. DS emphasized the importance of an understanding family, as well as the relevance of knowing oneself and one's interests and abilities. DS expressed previous concern about not having content knowledge of the CTE programs other than the one in which DS had experience. Not being a “content expert” was DS's initial worry; however, he found that the content knowledge was less important than having well-qualified instructors on whom he could depend to maintain the standards for the programs. “I know what I want. And this is exactly what I want to do. I like this job. I like the people that I work with. There’s a whole lot more to do here. You have to know yourself. That’s what I mean. You have to know yourself.” In the evaluative relationship between learner and mentor or leaders, context is taken into consideration as the learner progresses through a continuum of abilities by way of a process of reflection (Raelin, 1997; Hersey et al., 2008).

Suburban supervising senior administrator. For the suburban supervising senior administrator, mentoring ran horizontally and vertically. He valued the support among the Deans who shared parallel positions (horizontal), as well as recognizing his role (vertical) in nurturing their growth. By creating opportunities for them to collaborate and
draw conclusions under his tutelage, he was committed to challenging them to arrive at their own solutions to problems. One of the categorical responsibilities of an educational administrator was to develop people; to develop the work environment; develop communications; and develop necessary skills and knowledge (McDade, 1987).

The Deans help Deans a lot. So I try and set an environment—like right now, I’ve got three Deans meeting on an issue of how to redesign one of our buildings. You know, the turf is about the hardest thing to work with. I held the first meeting. They have the second meeting on their own. Then the third meeting, we’re going to come back together again and we’re going to have an architect there, and we’re going to start a planning process. But my job is to step back and push them forward.

Continuing, SSAS expounded on his expectations of how the Deans of CTE and the other Deans benefit from participating in projects and situations that have campus-wide impact. He looked for initiative and good communication by the Deans.

I think I expect them to be involved regularly and structured meetings that are held across my Academic Affairs Division. I expect them to take the initiative to approach other Deans when there are natural connections, like I’ve got three Deans involved in this Walmart grant. And they’re involved because they have the programs that work together and the training, we’re going to be providing to veterans and displaced workers. I expect them to take the initiative to communicate with each other about how they’re going to do that. Yeah, I think I would summarize it a little bit like this. My job is to do my job. Their job is to do their job. Our job is to all work together.

In response to asking how SSAS supports the Dean’s of CTE leadership, he emphasized professional development, and saw the Deans’ participation in the leadership team as part of his responsibility to mentor, and support. He offered several examples of people he had mentored and encouraged over his career, many of whom have since moved to positions of greater visibility and responsibility.

[I support Deans of CTE] the same way I do any professionals I’m working with. I’m forever encouraging them to be active in their professional associations and
the State associations. I encourage them to attend national meetings. We're also part of the League for Innovation here. So we have a lot of opportunities for travel to different colleges. Oh, yeah, I give them exposure in the community and I give them exposure with the board. And I'm very big on getting people to continue their education. Quite frequently, they'll be well prepared up to the master's level but kind of backed off, because typically they've worked in their profession awhile or they just haven't been focused on getting the terminal degree in their field. As an example, I had, when I was at Metro College, I was Academic Supervising senior administrator, I had a department chair who I thought was really talented. So I got him to look into economic development, started him on some of the grants and soon made him Director of Economic Development. And then when I left I recommended him for V.P. job because in the meantime he'd also completed his doctorate at [state university]. Now this guy started out as a barber. And then when the president of Metro College left, he became the president of Metro College. I've got somebody I was mentor for who started with me as Director of Titles III at Middleton College, completed her doctorate at the U of [XXX] and became the executive supervising senior administrator for ICCB.

The point SSAS made was that it was crucial to recognize the accomplishments of talented people and to support their trajectory to the next move in their career.

Philosophically, he pointed out that it was important to practice ethics with a big picture perspective: It was feasible that someday, he might be working for someone he had previously mentored.

The chief academic officer at Middleton after I left is somebody else I got to where he is a continuing ed. Dean. Got him to go on and get his doctorate at the U of [XXX] and now he's VP there. So when you get to be my age you've got a lot of these that you try and spot the talent and reward it. It's better to have somebody with you for three years that's very talented and you've helped them move on than to not—I'm searching for a word. You need to acknowledge the talent of your people working for you and step back a little and understand that if they move on because you've helped them get to the credential degree that's fine. You'll never know when you might be working with them or for them. And it works that way for—I mean, it helps you be a better person.

In response to the interview question about how the supervising senior administrator has different expectations of the Dean of CTE, and he also has to make an
initial assessment of the new Dean's level of expertise in managing the demands of the position. Unlike the transfer program Deans, Deans of CTE come to the position from a variety of potential situations: as an academic or as a practitioner who might come from any number of career backgrounds.

Well, a career and technical person, depending on where they're coming from, what their experience is going to require a more thorough knowledge of how to build curricula and programs. They're going to have to know the PCS codes and the CIP codes and how that all relates to the approval process from your college campus on up through the State. So for instance, if you have a nursing program change coming in that career and technical Dean has got to be aware that DPR is going to have to sign off on that also and the National League for Nursing. And they're not often on the same page. So it's bringing all that together in the right sequence. It's very important. So I'll spend a lot of time kind of assessing the depth of the Dean's knowledge on the ICCB rules and regs, the kind of career background they're bringing in. And then it's my job to pick up from that and help them make the next step wherever. It's very hard to generalize about because sometimes you'll have somebody come in with a great deal of experience and you really don't have to tell about the trade because they were in it. You have to tell about how to live in an educational setting.

Nastri (1985) used the situational theory model lens, and found that some community college administrators preferred a style of leadership that utilized high support (empathy) and low directive behavior toward peers and constituents. Further, through application of this theory, she found that administrators demonstrated a willingness to be flexible and vary their leadership style to match what they considered effective for any given situation. In the case of SSAS, he expressed such variation of leadership to match the situation and level of competence or skill that a given Dean demonstrated.

SSAS said succinctly, “My job is to set an environment where the individual can
try their decision making out, experience the results of that, and improve it.” He also elaborated:

I think things are important, if you're well aware of as a Dean and as a V.P., is what the office assignments are, how you're mixing people together. We had a four-person office in Science. What kind of professional development you ought to be encouraging in the person to get. I run a Deans council and an academic leadership team. I do everything I tend to put the Deans on joint projects because I find, you know, trust is built through time spend together doing activities. So depending on the personalities of the people, you can have some that come in and they're instant team members and you have some that are shy. Well, they're afraid. You know, they're going to be discovered, the other Deans are going to know they don't know so it takes a while to work that through.

McDade (2005) found that the strategies employed by a mentor included listening, reflecting, and mirroring critical thinking ideas and actions, motivating people to think critically, regularly evaluating progress, and helping critical thinkers create networks.

SSAS's answer to the question of how he supported the career mobility and professional development of Deans of CTE and other Deans demonstrated McDade's findings:

The same way I do any professionals I'm working with. I'm forever encouraging them to be active in their professional associations and the State associations. I encourage them to attend national meetings. We're also part of the League for Innovation here. So we have a lot of opportunities for travel to different colleges. Oh, yeah, I give them exposure in the community and I give them exposure with the board. And I'm very big on getting people to continue their education. Quite frequently, they'll be well prepared up to the master's level but kind of backed off, because typically they've worked in their profession awhile or they just haven't been focused on getting the terminal degree in their field. As an example, I had, when I was at Metro College I was Academic Supervising senior administrator, I had a department chair who I thought was really talented. So I got him to look into economic development, started him on some of the grants and soon made him Director of Economic Development. And then when I left I recommended him for V.P. job because in the meantime he'd also completed his doctorate at [state university]. Now this guy started out as a barber. And then when the president of
Metro College left, he became the president of Metro College. I've got somebody I was mentor for who started with me as Director of Titles III at Middleton College, completed her doctorate at the U of [XXX] and became the executive supervising senior administrator for ICCB.

These strategies employed by SSAS exemplify what McDade refered to as leadership cognitive complexity of protégés.

**A Priori Themes Related to Suburban Community College Findings**

In the suburban case, the Dean addressed more aspects of Raelin's (1997) work-based learning model than of situation leadership theory. DS placed a great deal of emphasis on the on-the-job experiences as the core preparation for success in his position. He stressed that good leadership came from having good mentors and then being given the opportunity to observe that good mentor. This perspective, while it looked to the mentor, used the lens of the individual supervisee obtaining skills through observation and practice. The emphasis presented by SSAS, however, lent greater emphasis to his own role as the supervisor or mentor (Hersey et al., 2008). He spoke to assessing the background of a new Dean in relation to the position, and regarded it as his responsibility to help 'bring along' the Dean with mentoring the former practitioner about faculty issues and the former academic about career and technical program issues. SSAS identified where the Dean was on the professional development continuum, and then prodded the Dean's skills along the desired path.

**Urban Community College (UCC) Case Findings by Themes**

**Formal Education and Professional Development Factors: Emergent Theme #1**

**Urban Dean.** DU confirmed that of what he anticipated to be the required abilities of the position, he was correct, but that it was also much more.
I thought I would have to understand scheduling. I thought I would have to understand how to work with people, the budgeting process and really that was probably about it. . . . I think they are needed, but I think it wasn't nearly a broad enough picture.

The Dean of the urban college considered the role of Dean of CTE programs as being challenging because it was situated between the union-driven, direct service delivery faculty and the senior leaders who implemented policy.

It's maybe related to the Dean's role in terms of leadership in administration. It's a wedge. You're caught between, I mean, you're caught between the faculty and the supervising senior administrator and the president. In a way, it's a really good role, but it's a really, really hard role because you have to be the peacekeeper, and you have to be the compromiser.

The urban Dean of CTE programs also, like the suburban Dean of CTE programs, perceived the likelihood of such a Dean's position being integral to institutional succession planning as tenuous. “It happens very rarely” that someone from a CTE program is promoted into senior administration.

That's kind of rare. So I'm thinking about it, and I'm thinking somehow the Dean that's the Career and Technical Education Dean has to get some experience with the transfer credit part of the college faculty. There has to be an interaction with them. And there has to be a respect from them. And it's really, I think what it boils down to is there has to be, for some reason, a respect for your place in academe for many people still in higher education, even the community colleges, and that's certainly true at [urban] college. It's really true here. And what has to happen is that I think if your background is in the Career and Technical Education pieces, you're going to have to work with the transfer credit side in significant ways that you can document and point to, and you're going to have to find some support from those transfer faculty pieces in order to be put into the planning.

A key point made by the urban Dean of CTE was that the person in such a position needs to “take what you're doing in your area of expertise and roll yourself in and become somewhat of a guru and a go-to person” for the academic side of the house; others “will learn to respect you. They need you.” When pressed to expound on the institutional
infrastructure of succession planning, the urban Dean said there would have to be a way to share the knowledge. However, reflecting further on the question, the Dean pondered with skepticism:

I just don't think it'll happen. I just don't think it'll happen unless there's a way to give the knowledge base of the transfer part of the college to the CTE person. And it's not that it shouldn't happen. That's not my point at all. But I don't see that it is realistically something that I see happening at least in the near future. Because I still think at least in many parts of education there is a bias against the Career and Technical Education pieces. They're the workhorse people, but many of the people that do it, do come from industry. Rather than having that European knowledge base that people assume is what is higher education. And if you look at rural college districts, which typically have trustees that are a little more provincial, that I think that that's going to be their way of thinking. And I think if you look at, I'm thinking about here at [urban college], which has a very strong faculty in terms of academic credentials, I know that that's the way they would see it. And that's unfair, but that's kind of what I think. I think it has to do in part because of the fact that we're still based upon this European model of education. I mean, that's what we base the whole thing on. And people just have a hard time breaking out of that mold.

Urban supervising senior administrator. Related to the interview question asked of the Dean about the Dean's expectations of the position prior to assuming it, SSAU was asked how he perceived differences between the Dean of CTE and the other Deans. Like SSAS, SSAU spoke specifically to some of the challenges that the Dean of CTE faces as opposed to those of the Deans of transfer programs.

The expectations would be a good person who has really good grounding in the academy and knows curricula, knows how to develop courses, work with faculty, perhaps might even have been a faculty member but not necessarily. I think in this position experience really does outweigh that. Someone who certainly is an excellent communicator orally. I mean, again, this person, to me, is much like, alike and akin to what I do as a president. You're out there talking to staff. You're out there talking to the community. You're out there far more visible than anyone else and lots of times those Deans aren't seen because they're not in the office a lot because that's part of our mission to serve the community. And I just go back to, again, [the Dean's] responsibilities. She has the responsibility of the faculty, but she also has the responsibility of the child care center. She has the responsibility
to the college's alternative high school. It's a very unique position and in all of those, particularly with the alternative high school and with the child development center, we have external agencies and requirements that we have to maintain. And so she's out in the community a lot. And of course, the expectations would be to develop curricula, you know, to evaluate faculty, develop new faculty, hire new faculty. So the expectations are very much like, in terms of some of the day-to-day expectations of a Dean.

SSAU spoke also to the demand for program development and the value of revenues generated by the CTE programs, and the impact those revenues have on the Dean's area of responsibility:

I think more than anything else there is a level of—there's an expectation -- that you're going to develop X amount of programs, that you're going to bring in revenue, that you're going to bring in new ideas that are going to enhance the mission of the college. I think this person is far more creative and far more connected than the other Deans to the community because they have to be. Because—but I believe more than anything else there's really an expectation of outcomes. You know, how many programs you develop, how many new curricula were you able to bring on board, how did that enhance the bottom line, the revenue of the college. So I believe that their expectation is quite different because—at least in the [district] colleges, there is an incentive where Deans can do this kind of work and they are able to generate additional revenue above what it costs to run the program, hire the faculty and manage the program. Anything above that, they're able to put into a revenue account. It's called an enterprise account. And that money goes back towards money that you can use to enhance your program. And there's no other Dean . . . .

Linking the uniqueness of the role of the Dean of CTE programs to leadership development, SSAU identified some personal attributes that lend themselves to certain people having a preference for that kind of role. He tied the Dean's role to the collaborative quality it requires among the campus leadership, while simultaneously recognizing how personal preferences and skill sets apply to Deans of CTE.

I think, again, you encourage them to be involved in leadership, professional development activities that would enhance and grow them into senior management, whatever their area of expertise would be. That they are an active member at your table when you have administrator meetings, your Deans'
meetings and things like that, that their voices are valued and considered. I think that there has to be recognition among the programs themselves, meaning the faculty, which then brings tension and focus on the administration directly to the CTE Dean. And then I think the other thing is just trying to be as realistic as possible. And by that I mean, there are some people who are inherently good at this kind of work, that love to get out, that love to work, you know, interface with people, have wonderful personalities and love the freedom that that offers, and don't necessarily like the other side of the house, (laughs) which is more mundane, routine, academic in nature. And so I think it behooves us to be honest about what that picture might look like. And my limited experience with Deans of CTE is that they love being Deans of CTE, (chuckles) and they're not necessarily interested in taking on leadership roles beyond that. It doesn't mean they're not capable. They really like the flexibility and all of the, I guess, the variety that goes along with that job. It's very unique to be a CTE Dean.

SSAU has always worked within the urban college system. Prior to moving into senior administration, he was a program coordinator and worked on the student side. Wanting to move up the career ladder, he chose to pursue jobs on the academic side of the institution. He obtained a position through that process that was similar to the Dean of CTE. Another Dean position, he had oversight of public agency and special programs associated with the entire college. He reported directly to the president. The purpose of the position was to develop the external relationships for the college, focusing on the public or government sector, such as the municipality, the county, the state, ICCB, etc.

And that was my closest job, if you will, to career/technical education, where I first became aware that there was even a difference because, again, talking with those individuals they're looking for promotions, (chuckles) for advancements and they're looking for how they can do career changing. And that's different from the academic side because many of the folks that I was working with were already working. I loved that job, but I also had some expectations from the president to go out there and have all those relations within [the community], I'm expecting to bring in X amount of programs. I expect to bring in revenue. So I have had some experience in being able to be driven by a bottom line. And I think if nothing else, your career/technical education Deans are driven by a bottom line, by and large.

The next move was to the supervising senior administrator of academic affairs. Finally,
the SSAU was encouraged to pursue the position of president.

**Personal Attributes and Background Factors: Emergent Theme #2**

**Urban Dean.** The Dean of career and technical programs at the urban community college stated that his perception of being qualified for the current position was partly “innate.” DU expressed that a lot of experience in competitive speech and debate in high school and college lent to feeling capable of meeting the qualifications of the job. A sense of working well with people, and helping them feel safe and validated was a skill that DU considered part of the qualifying credential for the position. “I know community colleges.” Diverse experience at the state level in community college-related groups was instrumental to DU’s self-assessment of being qualified.

The Dean at the urban college (DU) explained that the essential leadership practices go beyond being a manager, but rather, one must look at the big picture. DU said open and frequent communication are important; building relationships and seeing how to make connections for people to create something new; having the ability to motivate and maintain that motivation; and being organized are essential. It was also important to be ready for new responsibilities and new challenges, as well as to not micromanage when jobs were delegated to others. Finally, DU said it was essential to have “concluding skills,” which he explained as being able to make a decision and have closure to accomplish an objective.

DU described being surprised by the lack of acceptance by faculty once he moved into an administrative position. Believing that having been a faculty member, as well as a statewide advocate for faculty, would foster a feeling of collegiality among faculty, it
appeared to be a painful realization when the Dean observed how the faculty removed themselves from him. “I guess I envisioned it more as just a manager and everybody would sing Kumbaya at the end of the day and it ain’t going to happen. I was very well trained, but I still thought it would happen.”

DU described several experiences that contributed to his leadership preparation for the current position. The sequence of jobs from faculty to chair, to a Dean position at another college, fostered leadership skills. The opportunities to participate on statewide professional groups fostered leadership skills. Giving presentations, writing articles, and working as an evaluator for a foundation contributed to the development of leadership skills. Even being a parent of three children and actively and deeply participating in school and extracurricular activities for them simultaneously with being a division chair added to the cultivation of leadership skills. The city-wide community leadership experiences were “a big deal because it taught [DU] how to work with people and to make those connections. . . . I got really good at, you know, juggling the balls.” However, juggling so many balls led to a great deal of stress for DU.

Contributing to the stress was management of the huge budget for community partnerships connected with the Career and Technical Education programs. DU expressed how the budget raised visibility, and that visibility added more pressure to his job.

I mean, if this gets screwed up, it’s a big deal. I think you also feel like, in a way, you’ve got a big bull’s eye target on your butt. People notice those programs more outside the district. You can’t hide. There’s no place to hide. It’s too public. We have the biggest program within the [district]. . . It’s a big deal. So you’re going to get more publicity that’s definitely it, which can be a good thing and a bad thing.
Further, in this particular location, the Dean of Career and Technical Education had more power than the other Deans; he was third in the line of administrative leadership, which he considered very significant to his role and image.

Urban supervising senior administrator. The urban supervising senior administrator articulated three specific leadership practices that he considered to be essential to the success of a Dean of Career and Technical Education programs: experience in a specific field, or content knowledge; innovation or the ability to develop a concept into curriculum; and the ability to conduct research or have a practical pulse on the trends, of what's going on in the world.

It is essential that this person have leadership in knowing how to work with the community, know how to work with the academic side, know how to work with the occupational side, and also has to be very knowledgeable about policy that impacts vocational occupational education at the state level.

Continuing with other specifics, SSAU stated that Deans who oversee CTE programs need “really good research skills, to do benchmarking, to see what's out there, to have done the leg work, because if the college is going to put forth the resources to support the environment that they're recommending, you've got to have some pretty research.” In addition to the research skills, the SSAU stressed writing skills for developing or helping to write grant proposals, in particular. This was “a person that likes to develop and create.”

More broadly, SSAU insisted that this person—the Dean of CTE—has got to have an entrepreneurial spirit, has to be a self-starter, an innovator and certainly if [he doesn't] have those, be able to connect with people who do, so that [he] can do what [he] has to do, develop partnerships. Real, real key.” Of interest was SSAU’s comment about a Dean's perception of senior leadership, and the gender differences in leadership styles.
[I] also think it has to do with the leadership style at the top. And I think there are some individuals who, not bemoaning one or the other, condescending one or the other, but there’s a certain style that I think women have (chuckles) that lends more of itself to collaboration. And I think, you know, while that’s real work, I think it’s the most rewarding. And in that, I think you begin to create, you know, this opportunity where people see their value to an institution beyond their role because you’re focusing on their talents and their abilities, and you’re bringing that out and putting it all together in a nice little mosaic, if you will. That’s how I like to look at it. And I think that the career/technical education Dean’s value and some talents would certainly rise to the top. But it’s only that kind of, in my view, the style of the leader at the top who will either condone or promote that kind of opportunity [to] happen. And that can happen, you know; this is just unique to gender. I think it’s incumbent on the leadership at the top and perhaps one of the things that may happen through the mentoring process would be for the career/technical education Dean to make an assessment on the leadership style from the top because there are going to be certain leadership styles that may or may not lend themselves to those sorts of possibilities.

**Mentoring and Networking Factors: Emergent Theme #3**

Urban Dean. DU said he was “really well mentored.” Those experiences broadened and deepened DU’s understanding of articulation, financial issues, tenure goals, and other statewide initiatives that strengthened DU’s position as a qualified candidate for his current position. The knowledge of unions and the general politics of community colleges were other areas in which DU considered himself as having important expertise for the position as a Dean with Career and Technical Education responsibilities.

For DU, the most influential people were the president in one college and then a supervising senior administrator at another college where DU was previously employed, as well as leaders in the statewide organizations with whom he had a great deal of interaction in his extracurricular activities, such as with the Faculty Union Association; and also with faculty at the university where DU was currently pursuing a doctorate. These people mentored, guided, informed, pushed, supported, and promoted DU in each
position undertaken. One supervising senior administrator saved a position for DU for a year, until personal circumstances permitted DU to change jobs to a different community college. In all cases, DU reported that the mentors encouraged and expressed a great deal of confidence in DU's capabilities.

The Dean of CTE programs in the urban community college was redundant in responding to the questions of who influenced and mentored him along. DU once again named numerous people with whom there was a lot of interaction and support in statewide initiatives.

And so, I think they—mean, they just have kind of followed me through from [my] role in the state Faculty Association work, and at that point that's when I met these people and we would talk about state issues And then when I became an administrator, they've been willing to give me advice when I've needed it or I've been free to call them with questions.

**Urban supervising senior administrator, SSAU** spoke to the idea of mentoring from a different perspective. However, the underlying point was the same: the supervising senior administrator guides the Deans to reach the relevant goals, be they personal for the Dean, or broad based or institutional:

I think the most important [idea] is to make sure that the position or this person does not create a chasm between the liberal arts faculty and the career occupation faculty, and there tends to be a division of labor, if you will. And that only creates challenges and it creates a tier structure that is not healthy. And so the [supervising senior administrator] has got to make sure that the occupational faculty and the liberal arts faculty are on the same page, working together. Those kinds of things that happen normally, like with assessment. Making sure that they are there at the table when you're talking about assessments, student learning and critical thinking and computational skills and all of those things that really matter in the occupational world. You still have to create the opportunity because we all tend to work in environments where we feel comfortable. These are my colleagues. I'm talking about communications so I'm only dealing with communications. But guess what? Communications is paramount to automotive, is paramount to nursing. It's paramount to all the other occupational programs. So
how you get those faculty to begin to see that there's more of a connection than less of [one]. So we have to—I think it's incumbent upon the [supervising senior administrator] to create those synergies and opportunities to truly drill down and get at some of the issues that impact student persistence, impact student potential and impact student success because that's essentially the bottom line. And can also increase the faculty's ability to enhance how they teach. That's really what we're here for. It's the mission of community colleges. It's what goes on in the classroom. You can know all the widgets all you want, but if you don't know how to read and write and compute.

SSAU took the idea of mentoring and the role of the Dean of CTE programs further by associating it with career mobility. He spoke to how having worked in a Dean's position had prepared him for senior administration, and specifically for the presidency.

It's interesting, as I think about the job of supervising senior administrator, certainly it was very helpful to prepare me for the presidency. But I'd have to say that that Dean's job where I was really out there in the community, where I was really developing those programs and, you know, was really—that's what a president does. You're out there in the face of the college. You're like out there talking to everybody, developing programs, having the ability to be able [to wear the face of the college]. That's just an aside.

SSAU identified how he was mentored by faculty and that, had he not been open to hearing their often negative feedback, he would not have moved up the administrative ladder as successfully.

I would say mostly, other faculty, other faculty. Again, as you grow and move within the academy, you have to know and be able to relate with faculty. And so I learned so much from faculty. My style is one of collaboration so I learn as much from talking to staff as I do talking to other people because they're on the frontlines. They know. They know what's really going on and happening. So I have had benefit of really good mentors, and I believe that that's essential to career advancement. That's not only just here in the urban colleges, it's across the state. Getting yourself out there, getting connected. Also it was important to stay connected with your own professional organizations. I know there's a lot of career/technical education groups. Really important to do that and not miss those because that's where you learn and develop your network should you require any kind of support, help. “Hey, I'm starting this program. I don't know what to do.” I had other presidents. I had other top people in this organization and outside that definitely saw something and said, “You know, you should keep going.” It was like,
‘Okay.’ (Chuckles) So I'd like to think that that opportunity happens to most if you open yourself up to positive and negative. Because I got, doing that, I got far more negative (chuckles) feedback than I got positive, but I was certainly open to the dialogue. And so I just think you just have to be open to that.

A Priori Themes Related to Urban Community College Findings

In the urban case, data leaned more heavily toward Raelin's (1997) model of work-based learning than it did to situational leadership theory. The Dean and the supervising senior administrator expressed a lot of emphasis on learning on-the-job from the perspective of taking advantage of opportunities and observing their mentors. SSAU did not as much speak to mentoring the Dean as to the propensity Deans of CTE seem to have for preferring the position that takes them into the community and keeps them involved with constituents beyond the confines of the college. If his idea is valid, then the Dean of CTE is the epitome of Raelin's community level of the work-based learning model. SSAU related to Raelin's model further by sharing that his achievement to his current position was enhanced by his previous on-the-job experience that was akin to that of the Dean of CTE.

Findings Related to Guiding Questions

Analyzed according to the guiding questions for this research, data from the participants were reorganized to respond summarily to the research questions. In this section, each question was restated and then summarized answers to each of those six questions follow. As in the previous section where the cases were discussed individually, in this section the responses to the individual guiding questions are provided categorically, first from the Deans and then from the supervising senior administers.
Guiding Question 1: What are the essential leadership practices needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

Deans. The Deans agreed that it was essential to be a good communicator, a good listener, and to demonstrate confidence. They further agreed that it was important to be able to collaborate at all levels of the college, to set boundaries, and to acknowledge limits.

Supervising senior administrators. The supervising senior administrators also recognized a strong communication style as being essential to successful leadership, both in writing and speaking, with particular mention of showing confidence to contribute ideas to an issue. Consistent collaboration was also emphasized by all of the supervising senior administrators, particularly for the CTE Deans with other deans. The practice of staying current or on the cutting edge of Career and Technical Education, as well as to be knowledgeable enough to converse with the supervising senior administrator, was another criterion of good leadership practices.

Guiding Question 2: What are the essential abilities needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

Deans. The Deans’ responses to the second guiding question addressed the need to have a big picture perspective, to be a people person, and to have innate qualities or a certain kind of character that is comfortable with juggling several issues simultaneously. They emphasized the importance of good communication skills, and the comfort required to “let go” and “trust” the faculty. They stressed their ability to collaborate with community members, as well as internally, among colleagues in the college, and among professional
associations or groups. They characterized themselves as “being a big picture person,” (DS) “not a linear thinker,” (DU) and “being able to juggle a lot of balls at once” (DS).

All three Deans spoke of family influences that helped shape their personalities as they related to their current role in the community college. DR spoke of birth order, family responsibilities, and familial leadership. DS spoke of the influence of educators in the family who deemed education as a highly valued and worthwhile professional pursuit. DU spoke of the unambiguous and high expectations conveyed by certain members of his politically active family to be accomplished and to somehow assert a leadership role.

Supervising senior administrators. The supervising senior administrators emphasized that the essential abilities that the Deans of CTE need to demonstrate are excellent communication skills, consistent collaborative practices, proficiency with faculty evaluation, and initiative with regard to developing new programs. One supervising senior administrator answered that “collegiality” (RSSA) was the most important ability that a Dean needs. Another supervising senior administrator spoke of “the ability to influence people” in “ways that support the mission of the institution” (SSAS). The third senior administrator emphasized the need for “innovative” practices to respond to the needs of the community while simultaneously guarding against market saturation (SSAU). Collectively, the supervising senior administrators spoke of the Deans’ of CTE ability to maintain balance between the institutional values and mission, and the requirements to support and lead faculty under both internal (union contracts) and external constraints (accreditation and regulatory bodies).
Guiding Question 3: What are the essential experiences needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

Deans. The Deans of CTE consistently stated that it was essential that one in their position have some teaching experience. Another experience they emphasized was the involvement with colleagues with similar positions within their colleges and outside of their own colleges through professional associations. The third experience that the Deans affirmed were essential for their roles was community involvement with its diverse members.

Supervising senior administrators. The supervising senior administrators expressed that the essential experiences needed by Deans of CTE were content knowledge, awareness of the union contracts, and the ability to get along well with diverse people. One supervising senior administrator said:

[The Dean of CTE needs to be a] person who has really good grounding in the academy and knows curricula, knows how to develop courses, work with faculty, perhaps might even have been a faculty member but not necessarily. I think in this position experience really does outweigh that. Someone who certainly is an excellent communicator orally. (SSAU)

Guiding Question 4: What essential succession planning strategies are needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?

Deans. The Deans were reflective when this question was asked. Aside from the supervising senior administrator asking the suburban Dean what plans he had for when his PhD was completed, DS said “this is where I want to be. I want to retire from this position.” However, DS agreed with DR and DU with regard for the hypothetical situation of desiring an upward career move.
The other two Deans spoke of collaboration across a variety of areas within the college. Emphasis was given to the importance of having knowledge of the transfer programs and other programs and departments in the college “so that both the individual and the position are seen as broadly valuable to the institution” (DU). They stated that active participation in professional associations was vital. Generally, showing that the Dean’s of CTE position lent strength to the institution by helping to achieve the mission of the organization was a key strategy to succession planning.

**Supervising senior administrators.** The supervising senior administrators expressed that the Deans of CTE needed opportunities to be exposed to and undertake leadership experiences in a variety of departments and areas in the college, and also in professional associations as important strategies for career advancement or for succession planning. One supervising senior administrator emphasized that encouraging anyone to pursue professional advancement was simply an ethical responsibility he shouldered.

You try and spot the talent and reward it. It's better to have somebody with you for three years that's very talented and you've helped them move on than to not--I'm searching for a word -- you need to acknowledge the talent of your people working for you and step back a little and understand that if they move on because you’ve helped them get to the credential degree [or new position], that's fine. You'll never know when you might be working with them or for them. And it works that way for--I mean, it helps you be a better person. (SSAS)

SSAU further emphasized the importance of opportunities for the Dean of CTE programs to participate in professional associations and other activities that foster leadership. However, SSAU also remarked that Deans of CTE often really like the kind of work they do, and they do not necessarily redirect their career to senior administration.
Guiding Question 5: How do the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE differ from those practices, abilities, and planning strategies for other academic Deans? How are the practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies the same?

Deans. The Deans stated that the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE differed from those of other Deans by the different kind of faculty they supervise and evaluate, their level of involvement in the community, and the necessity of knowing accrediting and regulatory guidelines for the Career and Technical Education areas that were unique to their programs.

The Deans stated that the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE were like those for other Deans because they all required scheduling skills, they all required content knowledge, they all required working knowledge of the faculty union contracts, and they all required collaboration.

Supervising senior administrators. The supervising senior administrators also stated that the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE differed from those for other Deans by the different kind of faculty they supervise and evaluate, their level of involvement in the community, and the necessity of knowing accrediting and regulatory guidelines for the Career and Technical Education areas that were unique to their programs.

The supervising senior administrators stated that the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE were like
those for other Deans because they all required content knowledge, they all required working knowledge of the faculty union contracts, and they all required collaboration.

Two of the supervising senior administrators were almost dismissive of how important the specifics of the Dean's of CTE knowledge of accrediting and regulatory aspects were to the bigger picture of leadership practices and strategies they expected of their Deans.

Guiding Question 6: How do supervising senior administrators facilitate or inhibit the professional development and career mobility of Deans of CTE?

Deans. The Deans of CTE programs were consistent in expressing that the supervising senior administrators facilitated their professional development and career mobility by including them in their leadership team, mentoring them, and giving them opportunities to cultivate networks within and outside of the college. No Dean voiced that his current supervising senior administrator inhibited professional development or career mobility. Career mobility was facilitated by the opportunity to collaborate with other deans, participate in professional development opportunities, and work on projects that were relevant to areas of the campus that went beyond the parameters of the dean's direct responsibility. When a supervising senior administrator did not permit such collaboration, professional development, or shared project work, career mobility was inhibited because the dean neither learned about other areas of the college nor was the dean's visibility across campus heightened.

Supervising Senior Administrators. The supervising senior administrators in the study agreed with the deans. These supervisors encouraged the Deans of CTE to collaborate among all of the Deans on campus. They provided opportunities for
professional development, both on campus and through continuing education. The senior administrators provided further opportunities for the Deans to participate in state groups that were of relevance and interest to the Deans of CTE. The supervising senior administrators unilaterally encouraged the Deans of CTE to become knowledgeable and active across departmental lines, throughout the college, and on statewide issues, thereby promoting the leadership role and strategies of the Deans. Both competence and recognition thus lent to the promotability of the career Deans.

The supervising senior administrators described supporting their Deans of CTE programs similarly with how they supported other Deans. They stated that they supported the Deans in a reciprocal way: the Deans supported the mission of the college, and the supervising senior administrators embraced the Deans’ roles as part of the leadership team. While they all voiced that they edhe Deans’ collaboration within and outside of the college, only one of the colleges provided formally-structured opportunities for administrators’ professional development within the college. Therefore, within their respective institutional structures, the rural and the urban college supervising senior administrators had no framework through which they might formally promote Deans of CTE to prepare to succeed senior level positions.

Haynes and Ghosh (2008) applied a systems approach evaluation to explore how organizations determined the role of mentoring, and the efficacy of the Strategic collaboration Model (SCM) and its related succession management programs. The organization, by implementing formal mentoring program, created an infrastructure of succession planning. Organizational level mentoring increased organizational
commitment; employee retention and motivation; leadership development; and improved organizational, communication, and productivity. Therein lays the pearl: reciprocal regard between administration and employees fosters mutual benefit. Thus, the mentoring-centered succession management program develops leadership and facilitates the process of maintaining a competitive advantage in business practice.

**Chapter Summary**

This chapter provided an analysis of data from interviews, institutional documents, observations, and field notes, which together answered the six guiding questions of the study. Emergent themes were identified and explained with the data, first by each Dean and the paired supervising senior administrator, and then by summarized responses that addressed the six research questions. Additionally, some *a priori* literature was brought into the discussion.

The research questions were answered by conducting three case studies of Deans of CTE and their paired supervising senior administrators at one rural, one suburban, and one urban community college. From the data collected through interviews with the administrative pairs, institutional documents, observations, and field notes, three primary themes emerged: (a) formal education and professional development factors; (b) personal attributes and background factors; and (c) mentoring and networking factors. Within the dominant themes, there was general consensus among Deans of CTE and among the supervising senior administrators. Although each Dean and senior administrator stressed different details, the overall data analysis led to remarkably clear findings.
With regard for discovering the strategic leadership practices of Deans of Career and Technical Education programs, the Deans of CTE programs emphasized the importance of collaboration, communication, and content knowledge; they each spoke of family and professional influences that contributed to their professional achievements; each emphasized the importance of networking among their professional associations; and each Dean valued the experience of being mentored by current and previous supervisors and colleagues. The senior administrators, from the supervising perspective, emphasized the importance of collaboration; pointed to the value of cross-institutional involvement; and valued the Dean's learning from colleagues both within and outside of the community college in which they worked.

The following chapter will present conclusions drawn from the research findings, implications for the field of community college leadership, and recommendations for further research.
CHAPTER 5

DISCUSSION, CONCLUSIONS, IMPLICATIONS, AND RECOMMENDATIONS

There was a French general, I think one of Napoleon’s generals, who said, talking about leadership, “Those are my soldiers, I must follow them.” And that’s a little bit like that quote from Lao Tzu, you know, you trust people to do the right thing. You trust them to develop good practices. And you participate in that. (Supervising Senior Administrator, Rural Community College)

Introduction

This research addressed the need for Career and Technical Education program leadership due to growing labor force demands of business and industry, as well as the diminishing sources of public funding for the community college. Specifically, public funding sources from state and federal sources have been diminishing over the past decades. More and more, community colleges are depending upon partnerships with business and industry to boost revenues and support the academic programs (Friedman, 2007; Levin, 2001; Phillippe & Sullivan, 2005). Especially with the increasingly fast pace of technological advances, employers race to compete in a global market. They need workers who can meet the technical and pace demands of such a market (AACC, 2005; U.S. Dept. of Labor, n.d., retrieved June 14, 2008).

In all cases, the relationship between the Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators is a focal point for successful leadership and career mobility for the Deans of CTE. The trend among community colleges has been toward increasing emphasis on career and technical programs, for which the administrator charged with divisional oversight has increased opportunity to broaden his role in the leadership of the college. A review of the literature revealed the situational leadership theory (Hersey et
al., 2008), the work-based learning model (Raelin, 1997), and other leadership concepts to which this research related (Vroom & Jago, 2007; LaNier, 2006; Mapp, 2007; McDade, 1988).

A qualitative case study using the constant comparative analysis was conducted to explore the successful leadership practices of Deans of Career and Technical Education. Three Midwest community college Deans of Career and Technical Education (CTE) and their supervising senior administrators were interviewed related to the following guiding questions for this research study:

1. What are the essential leadership practices needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?
2. What are the essential abilities needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?
3. What are the essential experiences needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?
4. What essential succession planning strategies are needed by Deans of CTE in community colleges today?
5. How do the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE differ from those practices, abilities, and planning strategies for other academic Deans? How are the practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies the same?
6. How do supervising senior administrators facilitate or inhibit the professional development and career mobility of Deans of CTE?
The three CTE Deans and their supervising administrators were limited to
Deans/supervisors who provided oversight of early childhood education academic
programs which included a demonstration center or lab. One pair of Dean/supervisor
participants represented the rural perspective. A second pair shared the suburban view.
The third pair provided the urban lens. Data were collected from a combination of semi-
structured interviews that were conducted with each participant in the natural setting of
his respective college; through observations and case notes; and with institutional
documents that included, but were not limited to, strategic plans, job descriptions of the
Deans of CTE, and any professional development agenda for administrators if available.

After an in-depth review of the data, three themes became apparent, all of which
fell under a single, overarching concept. The three themes or core issues were as follows:
(a) formal education and professional development factors; (b) personal attributes and
background factors; and (c) mentoring and networking factors. The findings
underpinning these themes culminated in the following overarching concept: to be
successful in the role of Dean of CTE programs and to be considered for career mobility
to senior administration, Deans of career and technical programs must cultivate and
sustain visibility. This visibility must be established among stakeholders beyond the
career Dean's own college (the business and industry community), among the professional
associations related to the career Dean's field of study, as well as the fields for which he
provides oversight, and in trends and issues addressed in professional organizations
related to the community college (e.g., the American Association of Community Colleges
and the various state councils of community college administrators).
Employing the constant comparative method of analysis, the data from each participant pair of Dean and supervising senior administrator regarding the three themes was studied with the same lens as with the other two pair. It was apparent that personal development laid the foundation for the individuals' character development. Past education was another influence on the participants, as well as the continuing educational and professional goals. The third perspective considered for each participant pair was that of mentoring and networking. For each Dean and his supervising senior administrator, the data were organized according to these three converging themes. There were recurring regularities among the data collected from interviews, observations, notes, and institutional documents. These were the “internal homogeneous” criteria that represented regularities, such as career longevity in community colleges, across the data; also observed were some irregularities, such as the kinds of family influences, which spoke to the idea that there was “external heterogeneity” (Patton, 1990, p. 403). These irregularities were analyzed inductively as idiosyncratic or individual experiences that each variance in interview responses, institutional documents, observations, and field notes represented. One example of such a variance was found in an interview with one supervising senior administrator who, in response to the question about the influence of mentors, stated that he learned what not to do from a poor supervisor.

Discussion
The research findings, collected from interviews, documents, and observations, converged to answer to the guiding questions. Generally, there was consensus among participants: Deans of CTE programs responded with like answers to the interview questions, as the supervising senior administrators likewise responded with like answers to their interview questions. Together, the rich data revealed the following: the essential leadership practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies of the successful Dean of CTE; the essential experiences needed of the career Dean; the essential succession planning strategies needed by the career Deans; the comparisons between the requirements of career Dean and those of other Deans; and the facilitation or inhibition of professional development and career mobility of Deans of CTE by supervising senior administrators.

**Essential Leadership Practices and Abilities Needed**

The essential leadership practices and abilities needed by the Deans of CTE focused building support for the institution from two perspectives: (a) communication and human resource management; and (b) and cross-institutional and professional association involvement and collaborative decision-making. Across the board, participants and the institutional documents called for excellent communication. Knowledge and implementation of human resource policies and practices, as well as of contractual issues, were essential. Maintaining involvement in the professional associations that were relevant to the Deans' individual area of expertise was important, with great credit assigned to assuming leadership roles within those associations. The personality and character of the successful Dean of CTE included expressing an energy
or enthusiasm that moved people to action. Collaboration with regard to decision-making within the career and technical programs, interdepartmentally across campus, and among community partnerships was critical to promoting the institutional agenda of each community college.

The Deans of CTE were expected to have personalities that could inspire groups of people to take action in support of an initiative or program. The successful Dean of CTE had an ability to demonstrate enthusiasm that helped to motivate people. Further, the Dean needed the ability to relate to faculty issues and to evaluate faculty effectively.

**Essential Experiences Needed**

The essential experiences needed by Deans of CTE were teaching, having worked well with people, and resolving conflict. The Deans were credible to faculty when they demonstrated knowledge of classroom and/or online teaching. Deans needed to have experience of working well with diverse groups of people. They needed experience in other areas of the college, outside of Career and Technical Education.

**Essential Succession Planning Strategies Needed**

The essential succession planning strategies that Deans of CTE needed were visibility, to “be seen” of value across the institution and outside of the college in professional associations and organizations. A critical aspect of creating such visibility was through networking, assuming a leadership role in professional associations, and particularly by working with mentors. In the instance of succession planning, the role of the mentor emerged as critical to the Dean's access to participation in other areas of the college and to access associations outside of the institution.
Requirements of CTE Deans as Compared to Other Deans

For the most part, the essential practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for Deans of CTE were like those of other Deans. All of the Deans needed to promote the institutional agenda, to communicate effectively, to make decisions collaboratively, to have some teaching experience, and to demonstrate value to the institution to advance their position. The differences between the Deans of CTE and other Deans involved the substantial budgets for which the Deans of CTE had a unique responsibility, the expectation that Deans of CTE recruited faculty for their programs, and the degree to which the Deans of CTE were involved in the community, especially with business and industry, outside of the college. Related to the community involvement was the unique familiarity with accreditation and licensing credentials to which the CTE programs ascribed.

The Role Supervising Senior Administrators Play in Facilitating or Inhibiting the Professional Development and Career Mobility of CTE Deans

Interestingly, there were several ways in which supervising senior administrators facilitated professional development and career mobility, but only two instances in which it was noted that a senior administrator inhibited such mobility. Professional development and therefore, to some degree, career mobility were promoted by supervising senior administrators through providing opportunity to collaborate and to learn from each other; to model good listening and communication; and to support involvement in associations outside of the institution. Primarily, the senior administrators' purpose in supporting professional development was to promote the missions of their colleges, more than to
explicitly promote career advancement or mobility. The two cases in which professional development and/or career mobility were inhibited were: (a) a senior administrator reported that he inhibited such advancement by Deans who were unable to follow through with human resource policies, such as terminating an association, and (b) a Dean described that he was inhibited by an supervising senior administrator who suppressed peer communication and collaboration.

Three general themes emerged regarding how Deans of CTE successfully practiced leadership. The findings of this study supported previous work on professional development, articulated as situational leadership theory by Hersey and Blanchard (Hersey et al., 2008), and specifically, on professional development in the context of higher education, articulated as the work-based learning model by Raelin (1997). The supervising senior administrators, in particular, described their role with Deans of CTE as that of guide; one who assesses the strengths and challenges of the Dean’s performance, and then gives the Dean opportunities to experience tasks and dynamic processes through which the Dean is expected to fine-tune his performance, (i.e., his leadership skills).

This perspective relates to the situational leadership model as it is explained in terms of the supervisor assessing the supervisee's development and in the perspective of power held by the supervisor. The senior administrators described the relationships with their CTE Deans along the leadership continuum, as explained by Hersey and Blanchard (Hersey et al., 2008), in terms of identifying the developmental point at which each considers the Dean to be, and then providing the coaching and confidence-boosting opportunities for the Dean to refine his leadership expertise. There are four follower
performance indicators established in this theory: ‘(a) the unable and insecure or unwilling; (b) the unable but confident or willing; and (c) the able but insecure and unwilling; (d) the able and confident and willing’ (p. 175). In this study, the data indicated that all three of the senior supervising administrators generally evaluated the Deans of CTE along the third and fourth levels of leadership proficiency as presented by Hersey et al. (2008): Level 1: Unable and insecure or unwilling; Level 2: Unable but confident or willing; Level 3: Able but insecure or unwilling; and Level 4: Able and confident and willing.

For Deans of CTE, Raelin's (1997) work-based model provides a more suitable frame to explain the Dean's perceptions. The career Deans describe themselves as mostly competent and confident, seeing themselves as individual entities amidst the larger community. Nonetheless, when in doubt, the participating Deans identified their supervising senior administrator and the community of peers as sources of support and guidance.

Unlike Hersey et al. (2008) who stress supervisor performance evaluation and the balance among willingness, confidence, and competence, Raelin (1997) contends that individual experience, reflection, and activity are the main components of leadership development. The data collected from the Deans in this study are truer to this model than to the situational leadership model into which the data collected from the supervising senior administrator's better fall.

The Deans of CTE spoke more of a bottom-up process. This perspective operates contrary to that described of the situational leadership theory and the perspective of the
supervising senior administrators. For the Deans, the concept of “community” extended beyond the relationship with their supervisors and colleagues within the college to their network of colleagues among their associations and roles outside of the college. Although the data provided by the supervising senior administrators is explained more in terms of a top-down process and is more closely related to the situational leadership theory, it did nonetheless include an emphasis on the importance of the Deans’ participation in professional groups outside the college community, and outside the relationship with the senior administrator. This overlap or irregularity is one of the characteristics of the constant comparative method of analysis (Patton, 1990).

**Constant Comparative Analysis and Emergent Themes**

Once all of the interviews were conducted, the data were organized into groups that represented like answers, providing different perspectives to the central issues (Dye et al., 2000). Then relationships among the categories were examined and reorganized. Based on the similarities of responses given by the Deans of CTE and the senior administrators, data were reorganized and eventually converged into three general themes. These themes represented the regularities, or internal homogeneity. They were the common elements among the data (Patton, 1990). The Deans of CTE reported that their personal and family experiences influenced their professional choices and trajectories. Role in the birth family, family priorities and values, continuing support from their adult family life, such as the necessity and benefits of working collaboratively; the demand to organize and supervise younger siblings; and the parental expectations to
achieve contributed to the Deans' character trait development. Even at an early age, the Deans were perceived or 'seen as' leaders within their birth families.

A second theme that emerged from the constant comparative analysis was the education and professional development experiences that influenced the Deans' leadership practices. Besides having the content knowledge acquired through at least a master's degree in their fields of study, they also stressed the value of professional development through active participation in conferences and associations related to their field and their position in the college. Staying abreast of current trends in their fields was very important to their continued ability to provide leadership among faculty and programs. Having some teaching experience was also important to lending credibility to their expertise as an educator and as a supervisor of faculty. The Deans were 'seen as' knowledgeable and valuable by the faculty they supervised.

The third theme that became apparent with the constant comparative analysis was that of mentoring and networking. Besides participating in professional associations as a learner, asserting themselves in the leadership of the association, and being recognized among colleagues in their specific fields, were determined to be important influences of their leadership strategies and practices as Deans. Related to this idea was the role of mentoring in how Deans of CTE cultivated and sustained effective leadership practices. Both the Deans and their supervising senior administrators emphasized the importance of their relationship. The value of having opportunity to collaborate with other Deans and departments, to assert a degree of leadership across the college, and to comfortably rely on a senior support for guidance were the key factors in developing essential leadership
Figure 3. Spiraling themes converge on central concept.

practices. Beyond the colleges, the Deans also expressed the importance of colleagues in their professional associations and statewide initiatives who provided mentoring and
support for their leadership roles in their respective colleges and in the associations. The Deans were “seen as” having value to their institutions as persons who could expand their knowledge and expertise across programs and in their fields of study.

Conclusions

The research findings led to two key conclusions related to essential leadership strategies as practiced by Deans of CTE in community colleges today. The first conclusion is that the relationship between the Deans of CTE and the supervising senior administrators is critical to the leadership development of career Deans. The second conclusion is that the community colleges involved in this research do not have systems in place for the career advancement and succession planning of CTE Deans. The first conclusion is based primarily on participant interviews and related to the theory of situational leadership (Hersey et al., 2008) and work-based learning (Raelin, 1997). The conclusion regarding career trajectory and succession planning rests primarily on institutional documents, and is supported with observations and interview findings.

Essential Leadership Strategies: Practices, Abilities, and Experiences

There were three conclusions drawn about essential leadership strategies taken from the data analysis. The first was that the Deans of CTE programs who participated in this research credited their successful leadership practices to their family background, their formal and continuing education, and their relationships with certain supervisors and colleagues. Every participant, among both the Deans and the supervising senior administrators, emphasized collaboration across campus and participation in professional associations. Family experiences helped build the character of the Deans. Among them,
there was a perspective that sibling responsibilities, extended family's accomplishments, and specifically, relationships with their mothers, influenced the Deans' ability to have self-confidence, to collaborate, and generally to believe that he could achieve a position of leadership.

The second area of findings rested in formal or structured education, about which participants emphasized the importance of content knowledge, particularly in the Dean's specific area of expertise. While research participants were in agreement that Deans of CTE do not have to have extensive content knowledge of all the programs under their purview, it was important that they had enough knowledge to speak intelligently about those programs over which they had responsibility. Further, knowledge of other programs in the college was expected of the Deans of CTE.

The third set of conclusions centered on how mentors played a dominant role in on-the-job learning. In situational leadership theory (Hersey et al., 2008), leaders mentored the supervisee to the degree to which the supervisee is capable and motivated. Acquiring the essential leadership strategies was an outcome more of on-the-job learning than that of formal education. Some credit was given to graduate courses in leadership, but the majority of credit for learning how to practice leadership was by emulating mentors and other respected leaders with whom the Deans had had contact through their past and current roles. All of the Deans of CTE programs asserted that they learned from supervisors and colleagues. Focus, therefore, rested on the supervising senior administrator and his assessment. In this study, the supervising senior administrators assessed their CTE Deans as motivated and capable, and therefore in need of only limited
specific direction. The supervisors played the role of sponsor and guide, adapting to give the Deans opportunity to address novel responsibilities with some autonomy.

According to the work-based model of professional development in higher education, the first focus was on the learner, rather than on the administrator (Raelin, 1997). The Deans of CTE in this study expressed that they started with content knowledge from their formal education, but learned most of their leadership strategies in the context created by their position and their relationships with supervising administrators and colleagues within and outside of the college. The formal education and knowledge was what Raelin (1997) referred to as ‘explicit knowledge’ because it was ‘codified and transmittable in formal, systematic language’ (p. 564). Thus, the outcome of this research, regardless of Dean or supervising senior administrator's perspective, was that there was a continuous and reciprocating process of learner-teacher dynamics that lent to the development of essential leadership practices. This process reflected what Raelin termed ‘implicit’ or ‘tacit knowledge,’ because it was learning that occurred in active engagement (Raelin, 1997, p. 564). The supervising senior administrator may or may not be the primary mentor for the Dean, but all of the senior administrators did express that they expected the Deans to pursue professional development and networking opportunities through which the Deans were expected to grow, enhance their programs, and support the college mission.

Vroom and Jago (2007) concluded from their study of the process of leadership development that leadership can only be understood in relation to context or situations; situations account for about three times as much variance as do individual differences,
which underscores the important role that situational forces play in guiding action. Thus, their work further supports the application of Hersey and Blanchard's (1986; 2008) situational leadership theory and of Raelin's (1997; 2008) work-based learning model to the findings of the current research.

**Comparisons of Deans of CTE with Other Deans**

All of the supervising senior administrators indicated that, although their expectations of the Deans of CTE were more similar to, than different from, Deans of other areas and programs, there were nonetheless some important distinctions made. Table 1 compares the senior administrators' expectations of Deans of CTE with those of other Deans.

Table 4

*Comparative Expectations of Deans*

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Content/subject knowledge</th>
<th>Deans of CTE</th>
<th>Other Deans</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Faculty recruit</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Faculty evaluation</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Budget management</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Minimal/none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Community involvement</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Minimal/none</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Networking</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>Yes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Accreditation/regulatory standards</td>
<td>Yes</td>
<td>No</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

**Career Trajectory and Succession Planning of CTE Deans**

None of the three community colleges selected for this research had a formal succession plan in place for Deans of CTE or middle management to succeed senior
administrators. Of the three campuses, only one college had a written plan for workshops that promoted professional development of middle level administrators. The other two had no such documents, although all three institutions expressed, in some form or another, a goal of professional development in the strategic plans.

Related to succession planning, Deans were asked about career aspirations. For the most part, the Deans with CTE program responsibilities did not necessarily desire to move into senior management. Two said that if the opportunity arose, they might consider applying for a vice president's position. However, the third Dean adamantly stated that he was happy in his current position and hoped to retire from it. Interestingly, all three Deans either were pursuing or had just completed a doctoral degree, in spite of having no explicit plan to advance from their position.

Senior Administrators Promote or Inhibit Professional Development and Career Mobility of CTE Deans

Supervising senior administrators regarded the role and potential advancement of the Dean of CTE as being critical to promoting the mission of the institution. One senior administrator, in particular, explained that it was his responsibility to mentor and promote advancement of his middle administrators. He emphasized that a good leader had an ethical duty to help colleagues move forward. It was the institution that he represented that also had the professional development workshops established for Dean-level positions. This consistency intimated that the campus culture was one that practiced its value of leadership development.
In Chapter 2, Jones' (2007) study was discussed as another example of situational leadership development in terms of organizational culture. “It is the organizational structure and culture that are the principal means or fulcrum managers use to change the organization so it can achieve its future desired state” (p. 9). In the case of the senior supervising administrator who considered mentoring an ethical responsibility, he was creating and using the organizational framework and culture to guide behaviors, attitudes and values forward to promote the mentee and advance the institution.

Visibility

The three emergent themes of formal education and professional development; personal attributes and background influences, including family background and early expectations; and mentoring and networking spiraled into the overarching concept of Visibility. The data revealed that Visibility in the role of Dean of CTE was critical to the success of his leadership and ability to advance into senior administration through succession planning. However, there also emerged a theme that was paradoxical to the ones as explained here, which pointed to the unlikelihood that career deans would be recommended for senior administration when nominating committees are driven by faculty.

Formal Education and Professional Development

In terms of formal education, the Dean was expected to be known to be the ‘go-to’ person for that subject. For supervising senior administrators, the Deans of CTE must be identified as a resource for the supervisor and for the college. The supervising
administrators spoke of the Deans by describing, “They need to be conversant enough about the programs in their areas to speak intelligently about the subject.”

From the perspective of the CTE Deans, it was emphasized that to be a credible leader, the Dean should be a “go-to” person. Faculty, staff, and peers thus recognized the unique knowledge and contributions that the Dean of CTE made to programs and to the college in general. As one supervising administrator put it, “Faculty members expect to be able to carry on an intelligent conversation with their leader.”

**Mentoring and Networking**

**Mentoring.** In terms of mentoring, the Dean was expected to function with minimal supervision and to be assertive about solving problems; evaluating and managing human resource issues; and getting into the community to stay abreast of the market and to promote new programs to stay competitive with other schools. In the data collected from the CTE Deans, the previous and current mentoring relationships encouraged the Deans’ visibility. As one Dean of CTE described, the opportunities to participate in statewide professional groups fostered the Dean’s leadership skills. The city-wide community leadership experiences were “a big deal because it taught [DU] how to work with people and to make those connections. . . . I got really good at, you know, juggling the balls.” Giving presentations, writing articles, and working as an evaluator for a foundation contributed to the development of leadership skills. With the experiences with mentors, the knowledge of unions and the general politics of community colleges were other areas in which Deans considered themselves as having cultivated expertise for the position as a Dean with Career and Technical Education responsibilities. Those kinds of
experiences broadened and deepened the Deans' understanding of articulation, financial issues, tenure goals, and other statewide initiatives that strengthened the Deans' position as a qualified candidate for his current position. Clearly, the mentoring experiences contributed to competencies and leadership practices of the CTE Deans.

**Networking.** In terms of networking, the Dean was expected to practice outreach to other departments within the college and to extend himself to the surrounding community, and to assume leadership roles in professional organizations or associations. Supervising senior administrators stated that for the Deans of CTE to demonstrate effective leadership, it was important for them to participate in professional associations including, but not limited to, the content area in which the Deans had expertise, and statewide groups whose members shared like responsibilities in other colleges.

The Deans of CTE emphasized the importance of cultivating and maintaining relationships within and outside of the college for the purpose of gaining support for their own job. All of the Deans that were interviewed spoke of the significant influence and help provided to them by their colleagues across the community college campus, by colleagues they encountered in previous positions, and through experiences in professional groups. The CTE Dean in the urban environment spoke of the opportunities to participate in statewide professional groups as having fostered leadership skills. Giving presentations, writing articles, and working as an evaluator for a foundation also contributed to the development of the Deans' leadership skills.

Supervising senior administrators expected the Deans of CTE to be active among peers in their home institution, and also to reach beyond their own college to professional
groups, and business and industry. As one senior administrator stated, “I’m forever encouraging them to be active in their professional associations and the State associations. I encourage them to attend national meetings. We’re also part of the League for Innovation here. So we have a lot of opportunities for travel to different colleges.”

Another supervising senior administrator said:

I think, again, you encourage them to be involved in leadership, professional development activities that would enhance and grow them into senior management, whatever their area of expertise would be. That they are an active member at your table when you have administrator meetings, your Deans’ meetings and things like that, that their voices are valued and considered. I think that there has to be recognition among the programs themselves, meaning the faculty, which then brings attention and focus on the administration directly to the CTE Dean.

The supervising senior administrators in this study thus recognized the opportunities afforded by the Deans’ networking and stated that they supported the Deans’ participation in such networking activities both on and off campus.

Personal Attributes and Background

Family background and early expectations. Beginning with the personal backgrounds, the Deans were expected to assume a leadership role within their families, or in the professional arena, or both. Those early experiences appeared to set the stage for Visibility among groups of people, for confidence in their ability to be a leader, and for the competence to deal with challenges in their paths. One Dean stated that he was perceived in the family as competent and a person who could take charge, by description of growing up in a large farm family where both parents were unavailable to oversee the management of daily chores. In another case, the Dean’s early administrative experiences created the opportunity to be Visible as a leader.
I think being an assistant truly did help me because it wasn't kind of a gradual recognition that, aaah, even though I don't know heating and air conditioning, da-da-da-da, [thinking that] I can't do it; I could do it! And so I kind of felt very confident when the Dean's position opened, that I had the skills to do it.

To be considered part of the leadership team within their home institution, the supervising senior administrators expected the Deans of CTE to be Visible amidst their own programs, amidst the Deans' councils, and across the campus. In the aforementioned assistant Dean's situation, the interviewed career Dean's previous supervising administrator created the opportunity for her then-assistant Dean, and subsequently recognized the leadership potential of her assistant so that, when the supervisor planned retirement, her assistant Dean was seen as a viable candidate as her replacement. This Visible early professional experience led to an ad hoc plan for succession of the retiring Dean.

Succession Planning

Hence, Visibility was a focus of the findings with regard to succession planning. Aspiring for senior administration on the basis of CTE program leadership experience was a very challenging path. The Deans made it clear that since faculty-driven committees recommend candidates for administrative positions, its members would likely steer away from Deans of CTE because of their own perception that such a background would limit the Dean's ability to empathize with academic faculty. The trick, according to one Dean, would be to have something—a skill set—that everyone wanted. He said it would be essential to create a market for the Dean's expertise, thereby enhancing his value as a key member of the senior administrative team.
It was thought by the Deans of CTE interviewed for this study that, for a Dean who is limited by primary experience in Career and Technical Education, generally "it's not going to happen" that the faculty-driven search committee would see such a person as a likely candidate for a senior administrative position.

Another Dean said it is imperative to be known by the faculty and decision makers. "It's networking. Being out there and networking with the people who are going to be involved in making those kinds of decisions and that would probably build confidence in the ability to aspire to those VP positions or president positions." Another Dean said poignantly:

I just don't think it'll happen. I just don't think it'll happen unless there's a way to give the knowledge base of the transfer part of the college to the CTE person. And it's not that it shouldn't happen. That's not my point at all. But I don't see that it is realistically something that I see happening at least in the near future. Because I still think at least in many parts of education there is a bias against the Career and Technical Education pieces. They're the workhorse people, but many of the people that do it, do come from industry. Rather than having that European knowledge base that people assume is what is higher education. . . . And if you look at rural college districts, which typically have trustees that are a little more provincial, that I think that that's going to be their way of thinking. And I think if you look at, I'm thinking about here at [urban college], which has a very strong faculty in terms of academic credentials; I know that that's the way they would see it. And that's unfair, but that's kind of what I think. I think it has to do in part because of the fact that we're still based upon this European model of education. I mean, that's what we base the whole thing on. And people just have a hard time breaking out of that mold.

Reflecting on the possibility of a career Dean's trajectory into senior administration, one supervisor said:

I think, again, you encourage them to be involved in leadership, professional development activities that would enhance and grow them into senior management, whatever their area of expertise would be. That they are an active member at your table when you have administrator meetings, your Deans' meetings and things like that, that their voices are valued and considered. I think
that there has to be recognition among the programs themselves, meaning the faculty, which then brings attention and focus on the administration directly to the CTE Dean.

**The Visibility Paradox**

The Deans of CTE and their supervising senior administrators were not optimistic that career Deans would succeed senior administrators on that basis of faculty perceptions. The fact that the community colleges that were part of this study did not have systems for succession planning further exacerbates this dilemma for a Dean of CTE who aspires for a senior administrator's position. Ironically, there are several ways in which the Deans of CTE are Visible, but that Visibility has so far not appeared to provide the kind of leverage needed by the CTE Dean who aspires for senior leadership in the community college. One Dean gave a graphic description of the inherent pros and cons of the wide Visibility felt by the demands of the position:

I mean, if this gets screwed up, it's a big deal. I think you also feel like, in a way, you've got a big bull's eye target on your butt. People notice those programs more outside the district. You can't hide. There's no place to hide. It's too public. We have the biggest program within the [district]. . . It's a big deal. So you're going to get more publicity that it's definitely it, which can be a good thing and a bad thing.

Another paradox became apparent with the comment from one of the supervising senior administrators:

It's interesting, as I think about the job of vice president, certainly it was very helpful to prepare me for the presidency. But I'd have to say that the Dean's job where I was really out there in the community, where I was really developing those programs and, you know, was really – that's what a president does. You're out there in the face of the college. You're like out there talking to everybody, developing programs, having the ability to be able [to wear the face of the college].
These commentaries unmistakably present the Dean's of CTE job as extremely Visible and valuable preparation for senior leadership.

**Implications**

There are several implications that emerged from this research. One set of implications is for the Deans of CTE. The second set of implications involves the supervising senior administrators. The final set of implications involves the field of community college leadership generally and succession planning for CTE Deans specifically.

**Implications for Deans of CTE**

On campus, it is particularly crucial that the CTE Deans impress the faculty who participate on search committees with their understanding of teaching and their leadership capabilities. Deans of CTE need to focus on cultivating a leadership role beyond their immediate area of administration. Rather, they should extend their outreach to cross-campus committees, participate in leadership opportunities among professional groups, such as the statewide community college organization. Deans also should cultivate the mentoring relationship with their senior supervisors, and/or other persons in leadership roles that are more extensive or different from their own, be they within or outside of the community college.

**Implications for Supervisors of Deans of CTE**
The second set of implications of this research focuses on the critical need for supervisors of CTE Deans to create and promote opportunities for the CTE Deans to participate in cross-campus projects and activities, and to encourage the deans to assert themselves into roles that are Visible within and outside of the institution. Being known as an expert in a field of study, being part of the collaborative leadership team, and having leadership responsibility among colleagues and community stakeholders outside of the college are important to the faculty’s and administrators’ perceptions that the Deans of CTE have senior leadership potential. Thus, Visibility is critical to the career mobility of Deans of CTE.

Implications for Community College Leaders

More far reaching implications include that among the three campuses studied, there was no succession plan for senior leadership. This observation begs some questions: (a) Is it necessary to have a succession plan for senior leadership in place? (b) If it is advised that community colleges have such a succession plan, does each college benefit from using the same framework or nomenclature? (c) If a succession plan for senior administration were to be developed, what should it look like? (d) What kind of training should be necessary for the faculty and other participants on search committees with regard for how the Deans of CTE are far more qualified to a senior leadership position than previously considered?

Recommendations
Recommendations for Improvement of Practice

There is a two-part recommendation to improve practice. First, the overarching recommendation to improve practice is to develop a formal plan for succession of senior administrative positions, with inclusion of the Dean of CTE, among other middle administrators. Such a plan would provide a framework and an agenda for professional development. Part of the framework should require orientation and training that addresses how search committees fairly assess qualifications of candidates for senior administration. The succession plan would require collaboration between the offices of human resources and professional development within the institution.

The second part of the recommendation is a corollary to the first: Develop a plan for how senior administration and human resources will foster a guided mentoring protocol that provides opportunities in which Deans of CTE effectively participate across the college and outside of the institution. Such opportunities promote Visibility and therefore provide experiences that are essential to the Dean's perceived and actual leadership practices and abilities.

Recommendations for Dissemination

The dissemination of this research should occur in multiple forums with articles, presentations at conferences, and with students and leadership of community colleges. First, the dissertation should be submitted for publication in ProQuest and in the Education Resource Information Center (ERIC). Presentations or symposiums among local community college leadership groups, such as the one established by the Community College Leadership Program of National-Louis University in Chicago,
should be promoted. Further, the research needs to be shared more broadly with colleagues who represent national and statewide community college advocacy and interest groups, such as at the conferences of the American Association of Community Colleges (AACC), the Illinois Council of Community College Administrators (ICCCA), and other groups among the Illinois Community College Board. Another forum for dissemination should be in presentations at conferences of the College and University Professional Association (CUPA)-Human Resources (HR) conference.

Articles about the research and related letters to the editors should be submitted for publication in journals and online resources, such as in the Chronicle of Higher Ed and in the Community College Time, and the Illinois Community College Board by submitting the research abstract and summary to their respective publication departments.

Recommendations for Further Research

More research needs to be conducted to answer to the following questions: (a) Is it necessary to have a succession plan for senior leadership in place? (b) If it is advised that community colleges have such a succession plan, does each college benefit from using the same framework or nomenclature? (c) If a succession plan for senior administration were to be developed, what should it look like?

In particular, if it is justified that community colleges have a succession plan for senior administration, how the plan is developed should be explored by the American Association of Community Colleges, in relation to the published competencies of community college leadership, or by a consortium of colleges that are accredited by the regional North Central Association on Accreditation. While each community college has
a unique culture, consideration should be given to establishing a uniform guide for senior
succession plans that is inclusive of career Deans, as well as other middle administrators.

Another area to research is the background of senior administrators who were
previously Deans of CTE to explore their experiences with regard to personal
background, involvement and Visibility across campus during their tenure as Dean of
CTE, and the degree of involvement with professional associations each had outside of
the institution. In short, exploring their Visibility has relevance to the findings in the
current research.

The existing succession plans that have already been developed in community
colleges, such as the California Community College System (CCCS), should be
examined to determine how their framework and practices relate to the findings about
career advancement of Deans of CTE explored in this research. Specifically, the
California system lends insight into what can be developed for senior administrator
succession planning in the Midwest.

Chapter Summary

Data collected and analyzed from participant interviews wove a rich tapestry of
experiences and reflections. Together with observations, institutional documents, and
field notes, three general themes emerged to portray the leadership strategies needed by
Deans of Career and Technical Education programs in community colleges today: (a)
family and background experience; (b) formal education and professional development;
and (c) mentoring and networking. These themes funneled to a singular concept of
Visibility as the vehicle by which Deans of CTE might be perceived as candidates for potential senior leadership.

There are implications of this research for the Deans of CTE, the senior supervising administrators, and the institutions themselves. For the Deans, the implications concern the need to participate in multiple departments or offices on campus and in professional groups beyond campus. The implications for senior supervising administrators involve the demand to create and encourage the Deans of CTE to assume leadership in areas outside of their own purview so that faculty and administrators alike have heightened awareness of the Deans' leadership role. Finally, the implication for the institution is that there needs to be a formal structure for succession planning that is inclusive of the Deans of CTE as likely candidates for senior administration.

Further research needs to be pursued to explore and better understand how Deans of CTE in other community colleges foster their Visibility within and outside of the institution, and how some colleges manage succession planning for their senior administrative positions. Now that the essential leadership practices, abilities, and experiences have been explored in terms of personal and professional relationships, it is time to shift the perspective from the individuals and seek knowledge about how institutions can create the visible opportunities to advance such individuals to senior positions either in their own or in like institutions. Finally, research is needed to assess the benefits of having a common nomenclature for succession planning in community colleges throughout the Midwest.

*Organizational level mentoring heightens organizational commitment; increases employee retention and motivation; promotes leadership development; and results...
in improved organization, communication, and productivity. (Haynes & Ghosh, 2008)


BIOGRAPHICAL SKETCH

Shelley Levin has devoted several years to the field of career education and teaching in the community college. For almost 10 years, she was manager of two publicly operating early childhood demonstration centers at Oakton Community College. In that capacity, Ms. Levin managed a professional staff with whom academic students were assigned for course affiliation; she managed an operational budget of three-quarters of a million dollars; she developed and managed multiple public and private grants; she was the liaison to the rest of campus and the community for the practicing and the operational aspects of the ECE Academic Program; and she represented the college in community organizations locally and nationally.

Ms. Levin has taught a variety of early childhood education courses at three community colleges, including Oakton, Harper College, and Prairie State: Introduction to Early Childhood Education; Child, Family, and Community Relations; Administration of Early Childhood Programs; Language Arts; Communicating with Parents; and Intergenerational Programming. Concurrently, Ms. Levin has worked in various programs as the executive director or managing administrator for high quality, accredited early childhood programs in the Chicago area.

Strengthening her work in the community college and supporting families with young children, Ms. Levin has participated in the annual conference planning for the National Coalition for Campus Children’s Centers (NCCCC). She has been a reader for the US Department of Education/Office of Higher Education Child Care Means Parents in School (CCAMPS) grants. She has also read for the US Department of Health and
Human Services: *Fatherhood Initiative*. As an invited participant to the White House Conference on Child Care (1999), she attended a reception at the White House, hosted by First Lady Hillary Rodham Clinton.

Ms. Levin been a leader and a participated in multiple national and international groups, including spearheading the development of a *Special Interest Forum* for the National Association for the Education of Young Children (NAEYC); national and international conference planning committees for Generations United (GU), and attending and giving presentations at those organizations' conferences, as well as at two International Consortium for Intergenerational Programmes (ICIP) conferences abroad.

On the state level, Ms. Levin has participated on a multi-year training group for the Illinois Department on Aging’s (IDOA) community partnership grants for developing intergenerational programs. Another statewide experience was in child care licensing, with the Illinois Department of Children and Family Services (DCFS), at which time she served as the Department liaison on the committee to revise licensing standards for children in center-based programs, from birth through eight years of age.

Other accomplishments Ms. Levin brings to community college leadership are her publications, including a chapter on curriculum development in the book, *Under One Roof*, and a variety of articles, most recently of which was published in the American Association of Community College’s (AACC) *Community College Times* (August, 2009).

Appendix A
Interview Questions: Deans

1. What are the essential leadership practices needed by deans of Career and Technical Education (CTE) in community colleges today?

2. What background, knowledge, or skills did you have that made you think you were qualified for your current position?

3. Discuss the abilities you thought you needed before assuming the job of dean of CTE.

4. Now that you have been in the position for over a year, how accurate were your initial perceptions of the abilities you thought you needed to perform the function?

5. How inaccurate were those perceptions compared with the reality of the position?

6. How did your formal education prepare you for this leadership role?

7. What work and life experience prepared you for this leadership role?

8. How is the job as dean of CTE different from that of other deans?

9. Who were the people that influenced you to pursue the responsibilities of dean of CTE? How do you describe their influence?

10. Who were the people that mentored you either prior to or as you assumed the responsibilities of dean of CTE?

11. As you moved into the job, what other kinds of support or guidance would have been helpful to prepare you to be a successful dean of CTE?

12. What are 2 or 3 attributes you wish you'd spent more time developing in preparation for this position?

13. What skills, besides the ones already discussed, do you think you need to further develop and enhance your own career mobility beyond the role of dean of CTE?

14. What advice would you give to someone who, aspiring for career mobility, wants to pursue the job of dean of CTE?

15. What advice would you give to a dean of CTE who wishes to promote his/her current position as an integral strategy of institutional succession planning?
16. What have I not asked you about strategic leadership practices associated with being a dean of CTE that would be important for me to know?
Appendix B

Interview Questions: Supervising Senior Administrators

1. What are the essential leadership practices needed by deans of Career and Technical Education (CTE) in community colleges?

2. How are your expectations of deans of CTE like those for other deans?

3. How are your expectations of deans of CTE different from those for other deans?

4. What kind of support or guidance do you expect to give a dean of CTE to include him or her as an important part of your leadership team?

5. Is there any difference between how and of what you apprise the dean of CTE about the academic divisions or programs?

6. To what extent do you expect the dean of CTE to be involved with the academic deans?

7. How do you support or promote the career mobility and advancement of the dean of CTE to senior administration?

8. Before you became a vice president, what kind of leadership position in a community college did you have?

9. How might that previous community college experience influence your perspective in generally, as well as your views concerning the dean of CTE's position?

10. What are 2 or 3 attributes you wish deans of CTE spent more time developing in preparation for their position?

11. Who were the people who mentored you and promoted your career mobility or advancement to senior administration? How did they do so?

12. What have I not asked you about strategic leadership practices associated with being a dean of CTE that would be important for me to know?
Appendix C

Confidentiality Agreement: Data Transcription

This confidentiality form articulates the agreement made between Shelley Levin, the researcher, and Transcription Professionals.

I understand and acknowledge that by transcribing the audio recordings provided to me by Shelley Levin, that I will be exposed to confidential information about the research study and the research participants. In providing transcription services, at no time will I reveal or discuss any of the information to which I have been exposed.

In addition, at no time will I maintain copies of the electronic or paper documents generated. Further, upon completing each transcription, I agree to provide the electronic documents to the researcher:

Shelley Levin

xxx McHenry Road, #x

Wheeling, IL 600090

Home phone: 847.947.xxxx

Work phone: 847.813.xxxx

Cell phone: 847.921.xxxx

I understand that breach of this agreement as described above could result in personal and professional harm to the research participants to whom I will be held legally responsible.

Transcriptionist's Signature: ____________________________ Date: __________

Researcher's Signature: ______________________________ Date: __________
Appendix D

Informed Consent: Panel of Experts

Thank you for agreeing to participate in this study that will take place from June, 2009 to January, 2010. This form outlines the purposes of the study and provides a description of your involvement and rights as a participant.

I consent to participate in a research project conducted by Shelley Levin, a doctoral student at National-Louis University located in Chicago, Illinois.

I understand the study is titled Mentoring Career Deans: Uncharted Paths. The purpose of this study is to explore what abilities and attributes are essential for community college deans to provide successful leadership for a diverse range of career programs.

Specifically, the study will collect data and insights regarding the following questions:
1. What are the essential abilities needed by CTE Deans in community colleges today?
2. What are the essential experiences needed by CTE Deans in community colleges today?
3. What are the essential succession planning strategies needed by CTE Deans in community colleges today?
4. How do the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for CTE Deans differ from those practices, abilities, and planning strategies for other academic deans? How are the practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies the same?
5. How do supervising vice presidents facilitate or inhibit the professional development and career mobility of CTE Deans?

I understand that my participation is voluntary and can be discontinued at any time until the completion of the dissertation.

I understand that my exposure to risks is minimal, no greater than that encountered in everyday life. Further, the information gained from this study could be used to assist career deans and vice presidents, as well as development of community college administrative succession plans.

I understand that my identity will be kept confidential by the researcher coding the data and that my identity will neither be attached to the data I contribute, nor stored with other project data. I understand that only the researcher, Shelley Levin, will have access to a secured file cabinet in which will be kept all transcripts, taped recordings, and field notes from the focus group in which I participated.
I understand that the results of this study may be published or otherwise reported to scientific bodies, but my identity will in no way be revealed. Also, the name of my employer and/or school will not be published.

I understand that in the event I have questions or require additional information I may contact the researcher: Shelley Levin at xxx McHenry Road, #x, Wheeling, Illinois 60090; phone 847-947-xxxx; email joygee3@yahoo.com

If you have any concerns or questions before or during participation that you feel have not been addressed by the researcher, you may contact my Primary Advisor and Dissertation Chair: Dr. Martin Parks, National-Louis University (Chicago Campus), 122 S. Michigan Avenue, Chicago, IL 60603. Phone (312) 261-3019 or E-mail: martin.parks@nl.edu

Participant's Signature:______________________________  Date:____________

Researcher's Signature:_____________________________  Date:____________
Appendix E

Demographic Questions for Dean Participants

Participant name: ________________________________ Date: __________________

Please provide the following information:

1. Current college:
   
   Name: ____________________________________________________________
   
   Job title: _________________________________________________________
   
   City/State: ____________________________
   
   # of years in this position? __________________

2. What departments have you supervised and/or worked in in a community college/post secondary institution other than community college. List all departments throughout your career, as well as length of time and in which area (i.e., academic side of the house, career and technology department, student services, support services, advising, financial aid, maintenance, etc.). It is assumed that if you had supervisory responsibility, you were employed full time. If that is not the case, please indicate where appropriate.

   Departments | For how long?
   --------------|------------------
   (Circle those departments which you supervised.)
   1. ____________________________
   2. ____________________________
   3. ____________________________
   4. ____________________________
   5. ____________________________
Other:

3. Business or industry experience. Please list your last two career or technology positions (if any) other than in postsecondary education:

   Job/position Title: ____________________________________________

   # of years worked ____________________________________________

   Brief job description: _________________________________________
                        ___________________________________________________

   Job/position Title: ____________________________________________

   # of years worked ____________________________________________

   Brief job description: _________________________________________
                        ___________________________________________________
Appendix F

Informed Consent: Participant

Thank you for agreeing to participate in this study that will take place from September, 2008 to January, 2010. This form outlines the purposes of the study and provides a description of your involvement and rights as a participant.

I consent to participate in a research project conducted by Shelley Levin, a doctoral student at National-Louis University located in Chicago, Illinois.

I understand the study is titled *Mentoring Career Deans: Uncharted Paths*. The purpose of this study is to explore what abilities and attributes are essential for community college deans to provide successful leadership for a diverse range of career programs.

Specifically, the study will collect data and insights regarding the following questions:

- What are the essential abilities needed by deans of CTE in community colleges today?
- What are the essential experiences needed by deans of CTE in community colleges today?
- What are the essential succession planning strategies needed by deans of CTE in community colleges today?
- How do the essential leadership practices, abilities, experiences, and succession planning strategies for deans of CTE differ from those practices, abilities, and planning strategies for other academic deans? How are the practices, abilities, and succession planning strategies the same?
- How do supervising vice presidents facilitate or inhibit the professional development and career mobility of deans of CTE?

I understand that my participation will consist of one in-person audio-taped interview lasting 1 to 1½ hours in length with a possible second, follow-up interview in person or by telephone, lasting 1 to 1½ hours in length. I understand that I will receive a copy of my transcribed interview, at which time I may clarify information.

I understand that my participation is voluntary and can be discontinued at any time until the completion of the dissertation.

I understand that only the researcher, Shelley Levin, will have access to a secured file cabinet in which will be kept all transcripts, taped recordings, and field notes from the interview(s) in which I participated.
I understand that the results of this study may be published or otherwise reported to scientific bodies, but my identity will in no way be revealed. Also, the name of my employing community college will not be published.

I understand there are no anticipated risks or benefits to me, no greater than that encountered in daily life. Further, the information gained from this study could be used to assist career deans and vice presidents, as well as development of community college administrative succession plans.

I understand that in the event I have questions or require additional information I may contact the researcher: Shelley Levin at xxx McHenry Road, #x, Wheeling, Illinois 60090; phone 847-947-xxxx email joygee3@yahoo.com

If you have any concerns or questions before or during participation that you feel have not been addressed by the researcher, you may contact my Primary Advisor and Dissertation Chair: Dr. Martin Parks, National-Louis University (Chicago Campus), 122 S. Michigan Avenue, Chicago, IL 60603. Phone (312) 261-3019 or E-mail: martin.parks@nl.edu

Participant's Signature:_____________________________ Date:____________

Researcher's Signature:____________________________ Date:____________